AJPAM is the official Journal of the African Association for Public Administration and Management (AAPAM), Africa’s continental professional association for public administrators and managers. AAPAM brings together policy makers, management practitioners and scholars associated with the state and non-state sectors. AAPAM is also affiliated with other International and professional bodies across the globe.

AJPAM is a bi-annual publication published in January and July each year. Manuscripts discussing a range of issues of public administration, leadership, management, development and related matters across the continent and from other parts of the world are welcome.

AJPAM’s editorial policy is to publish original works that are practical and scientifically based and/or suggest new insights and innovative ideas in African and Global Administration and Management.

Authors are charged 100 USD (One Hundred United States Dollars) for each paper published in AJPAM as from 1st January 2018. Payment is effected The money shall be paid when submitting the final copy after peer review (see account details below) Relevant bibliographical notes, literature and book reviews are invited as well.

Interested contributors are advised to submit their manuscripts in electronic format in MS word by email, two hard copies of the manuscript may be sent in addition. The articles should comply with the following:

1. Title page, with full names of author, an abstract of 150-200 words and relevant key words
2. Be formatted in MS word, be typed double – spaced with a size 12 font.
3. Not exceed 6,000 words.
4. Bibliographic references should be in the Harvard style
5. Ensure that in the event that endnotes are used, they should be very brief, limited to observations and comments that do not form part of the bibliographical reference. Endnotes should be numbered in the text and placed in a consecutive order at the end of the text, immediately before the list of references.
6. The Tables and Figures should be appropriately named, numbered and placed in the text.

Authors are advised to ensure that their articles;

a. Present new knowledge in the field of Public Administration and Management.
b. Employ scholarly and professional language in English or French.
c. Generate discussions that can lead to mapping out solutions to challenges of Public Administration and Management.

d. Express perspectives from different African Regions.

e. Contain, as far as possible, implications for public sector managers and administrators.

AJPAM is a refereed journal as all articles are subjected to a rigorous process of peer review before publication. The views expressed in articles are those of the author(s). Neither AJPAM nor AAPAM can be held liable for any residual errors. However, by the authors agreeing to the decision of AAPAM to publish their articles, they are in effect passing their copyright to AAPAM. Authors are entitled to two copies of the issue of the Journal in which their articles are published.

Contributions should be forwarded to: aapam@aapam.org and info@aapam.org
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Message from the Editor</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State Formation, Identity Value of Citizenship and the Role of the Civil Service: Patterns and Trends in Nigeria</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Jide Balogun</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integration and Inclusivity: Fundamentals for Transformation of Governance and Public Administration in Africa</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Bashi Mothusi</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perspectives on Gender and Corruption in Botswana: Lessons and Implications for Anti-Corruption Policy</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Abiodun Marumo Tito Omotoye</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imperatives: The Five P’s: People, Planet, Prosperity, Peace and Partnerships and Sustainable Development Goals - The Need to Transform Public Administration and Management</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Dorothy, Mpabanga and L. Sesa</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female Leadership and Key Decision Making in the Roman Catholic Church: Is There Hope at the End of the Tunnel?</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Chikerema A.F. Sithole A and Colonel. S. Chikwavira</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Theory and Practice of Local Governments’ Monitoring Role in Implementing Decentralisation. The Case of Uganda</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Stephen Gunura Buengye</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Introduction by the Chief Editor

It is a great pleasure to introduce to you the latest edition of AAPAM’s journal which has for many years served as a forum for debate and information pertaining to public administration and management in Africa. The journal has regularly tried to serve its readers by publishing articles that are a reflection of the changing landscape of public services in Africa. As a journal that is written both for academics and public servants, the journal has been a bridge which links to sometimes unduly separate worlds of government on the one hand and higher education on the other. The journal is firmly aligned to AAPAM’s commitment to promoting research aimed at contributing to solving the development needs of African states.

It is very pleasing that the present volume includes an article by Professor Jide Balogun from Nigeria who has a long association with AAPAM going back to the early days of the journal. He was our first editor. I have in one of my bookcases a copy of the issue of January 1992 which contained five articles by distinguished African academics and public servants. He is ideally placed to write for us an historical piece on state formation in Africa. His article is a reminder of the importance of history and therefore the need to eschew the narrowness of what in some quarters has been termed ‘presentism’. Thank you, Professor Balogun, for your article in this volume and for your pioneering service for AAPAM and its members.

The other articles tackle contemporary themes. This volume includes an article by Mothusi on the inter-related issues of integration and inclusivity in Africa; these are issues of growing importance in debates about development in general as well as emerging as key concerns for Public Administration and Management. For example, such issues were often raised by participants at the 2018 AAPAM Round Table in Botswana. Another theme which is picking up momentum is that of gender. Omotoye looks at the case of Botswana and spells out the implications for policy makers of the ways in which gender and corruption are connected. It is well known that the sustainable development goals are now very much on the agenda for Africa. However, the implications for Public Administration and Management are not always seen as clearly as they need to be. The article by Mpabanga and Seta helps to improve this state of affairs in their article which pinpoints what they see as the 5 ‘Ps’. As we need to give greater commitment to sustainable development, their article is a timely reminder of the need for more effective state action in support of the SDGs. Finally we include a piece from Zimbabwe which is about the Roman Catholic Church. Chikerema, Sithole and Chikwavira have carried out research which reminds us, inter alia that non-government organizations have been of growing importance for some years now. It is hoped that more articles of this sort can be carried in the journal to remind us that the public sector should not be divorced from the important work being done by churches and other NGOs. Also of importance is the article on project management in local government in Uganda by Bwengye which highlights the need for significantly more effective monitoring without which critical data cannot be reliably obtained. The article presents a large amount of information arising from fieldwork undertaken for the author’s doctoral thesis.
I hope you find much to interest you in this volume and that you enjoy reading the articles. I also hope you will continue to support your journal as it strives to deliver on our vision and mission which, in a nutshell, is to promote excellence, professionalism and best practice in African states.

Prof. Malcolm Wallis
Chief Editor
State Formation, Identity Value of Citizenship and the Role of the Civil Service: Patterns and Trends in Nigeria

M. J. Balogun

Abstract

The article argues the proposition that where those currently running a state cannot legitimately claim to be its founders, securing obedience to the state requires, at the minimum, that genuine efforts be made to implement inclusive, identity-strengthening policies and programmes. Specifically, if a state appears unable or unwilling to provide credible answers to dominant concerns—especially, concerns for personal security, for equal and unimpeded access to essential services, and for unhampered exercise of rights that neither imperil nor annihilate opposite numbers’ rights—the citizen will inevitably look elsewhere for support. Herein lies the significance of the civil service’s role. The article begins with a conceptual framework depicting the circumstances under which individuals and groups surrender fractions of their freedoms to enable a central authority to tackle problems that are beyond the capacity of individuals. It then proceeds to track the process of state formation in Nigeria. In the accompanying sections, the article examines patterns and trends in the growth of the civil service, assesses the role of the bureaucracy in the development of modern Nigeria, and discusses the future role of the civil service.

Key words: State, State Stages, Legitimacy, Indigenous, Natives, State Systems

The Whys and the wherefores of State Formation and Survival: A Conceptual Framework

State creation is not a science, let alone an exact one. At one time or place, it might owe its existence to the empire-building instinct of an individual endowed with a few attributes—notably, charisma, foresight, ingenuity, astuteness, ruthlessness, courage and determination. On another day, the state only emerges when individuals, like those in early Greek city-states, meet to decide issues of common concern or, failing that, implicitly or explicitly mandate a central authority to act on their behalf. At yet another time, it takes the intervention of a foreign power to establish order in a distant but hitherto anarchic society.

Examples of forceful personalities creating order out of chaos abound in history. They include Genghis Khan, the brain behind one of the largest empires in history; Alexander the Great, who united the Greek city-states and led the Corinthian League. Other historic figures that brought formerly autonomous groups under diverse forms of centralized rule are Charlemagne, Julius Caesar, Hannibal, the Muslim Caliphs, and the Ottoman Sultans. Among Africa’s state builders are Sonni Ali Ber, Askya Muhammadu Ture, Oduduwa, Shaka the Zulu, and Othman Dan Fodiyo, the erudite Islamic scholar whose teachings contributed

1Director, DRM Associates, former Senior Adviser, UN Headquarters, New York, and former Director-General, The Administrative Staff College of Nigeria e-mail: balogunjide@hotmail.com

2He was variously known as King of Persia, Babylon and Asia, and King of Four Quarters of the World.
largely to the overthrow of the superstition-prone and corruption-ridden Hausa city states and their replacement by the Caliphate.

Where a state owes its existence to individual acumen, it becomes the individual’s personal preserve. In that case, the ruler is at liberty to say l’etat c’est moi (the state it is me). His death does not terminate his “proprietary rights” as the rights are inheritable by his descendants.

As it so happens, it is not in every case that an individual unilaterally and successfully imposes his will on a freedom-loving people. A people may by itself, and considering past historical ties, existing cultural affinity, and/or the perceived benefits of association, decide that its overall interest lies in surrendering a fraction of individual rights and investing a central authority with the residual sovereignty to safeguard collective interests and freedoms. This is the case where a “People” come together to “give themselves” a constitution or to ratify a ‘social contract’ empowering the state to take authoritative decisions—decisions which, with a bit of luck, would serve the interests and reaffirm the rights and freedoms of the associating groups.

On yet another day, the state comes into being, neither because an individual proactively and unilaterally decide to create one, nor due to a community’s spontaneous or instinctive embrace of order over lawlessness, but because a foreign power sees an opportunity to bring the benefits of “civilization” to a medley of warring tribes, and pave the way for the exploitation of the colonized territory’s resources.

The State’s Claim to Obedience

Who brings a state into being is at any rate not as important as the efforts made to proceed from the founders’ dream to the institution of measures aimed at securing the loyalty of the associating parties and at preserving the state’s sovereignty and territorial integrity. The dream is likely to turn into a nightmare where what was earlier promised is different from what is subsequently delivered.

This raises the question why one state waxes strong while another constantly struggles to survive. Why is one state obeyed while another is constantly and, at times, successfully, defied? The realist school of thought’s answer to this question is simple: the will of a state prevails or fails depending on how far the state founders are prepared to go to apply brute force and cunning in order to interdict anarchy and enthrone civil order. The average individual, according to the realist thinkers, is too self-absorbed—too self-seeking—to part with his/her rights and freedoms. It is then up to a central authority to insure itself against rebellion by applying a combination of subterfuge, cajolery, bullying and coercion. After all, freedom left unchecked produces a life that Hobbes terms “poor, nasty, brutish, and short” (Hobbes, 1985:223).

What does one make of a state founded on a mixture of force and deception? Are the state apparatuses of control and coercion really anchored on the ‘will of the people’ or are they mere illusions created to give an appearance of popular consent?

According to the realists (particularly, Thucydides, Hobbes, Machiavelli, and Morgenthau), moral values are mere illusions. Norms of right and wrong are created by
individuals and cultures, not discovered through a rational process of deduction and experimentation. Since they evolve under different circumstances, moral values are invoked only when they serve a concrete interest but cast aside when they do not.

The idealists differ with their realist counterparts not only on morality but also on why individuals submit to a central authority. John Locke agrees with the view that man's natural inclination is toward perfect and complete liberty—liberty to do what concerns none but the doer. However, where the realists place emphasis on a blend of wile and intimidation, Locke and other idealists underscore the significance of reason. He contends that as one endowed with the reasoning faculty, the individual is too sensitive to the risks of anarchy to renounce allegiance to organized government.

The state of nature might thus be lacking in centralized government, but not in morality. The moral awareness of an otherwise anarchic society explains the individual's readiness to submit to a central authority. The individual is fully conscious of the fact that s/he cannot behave as s/he wishes all the time, because to so do is to expose one to the aggressive, predatory and freedom-pre-empting urges of the other.

The only historical exception to the rule of unbounded freedom is Adam, but then he was all alone and had the Garden of Eden all to himself. Regardless of the fact that Adam's descendants lived in a state of nature for several millennia, individuals had to sacrifice some of their rights as they “grew and multiplied” and the chances of one person's choices conflicting with another's increased exponentially (Balogun, 2011). All the same, the idealists insist that even when rights are foregone for the greater good of society, the sovereign still has an obligation to safeguard whatever is left of those rights. The challenge then is finding the right formula that balances state sovereignty with individual freedom. This is the essence of Rousseau’s social contract (Rousseau, 1987:148).

The Legitimacy of the Post-Colonial Kingdom

It is all well and good drawing up a social contract that safeguards the rights and freedoms of the individual. As argued in this paper, such an arrangement might work where a critical mass successfully challenges the “divine rights” of Kings and/or constructs a state founded on the will of the people. The arrangement will, in all probability, break down in states created by external colonial powers.

Heterogeneity erects insuperable obstacles to state formation in post-colonial states. It, heterogeneity, also opens up opportunities for the consolidation of patron-client arrangements and rent-seeking. Appealing to ethno-religious sentiments, and applying methods fair and foul, aspiring leaders pay little attention to the needs and demands of diverse constituencies. As soon as power falls into the hands of the seeker, s/he leaves nothing undone to retain it. S/he starts by bending public institutions to his/her will. In no time, state institutions are turned into the stomping grounds of politically connected individuals, notably, “first ladies”, first sons/daughters, political god-fathers, and those authorized to act on “instructions from above”.

Long-time success demands that conscious and sustained efforts be made to command
the allegiance of heterogeneous groups to an externally imposed ‘social contract’. This warrants enacting and executing measures that incrementally enhance the “identity value of citizenship.” In a post-colonial state, neither realism’s fallback on cunning and compulsion nor idealism’s reliance on reason would suffice in holding the state together. The post-colonial state will live or die depending on whether it is the state rather than the sub-cultures that responds effectively to the citizen’s daily concerns—particularly, the yearnings for personal security, and for access to life’s necessities.

This underscores the critical role of the civil service bureaucracy in the state formation process. The bureaucracy’s legal-rational authority, its formalized processes, its reservoir of technical know-how, these and other attributes, adequately prepare it for its civilizing mission, which is essentially the mission of shepherding a community from the state of nature (or lawlessness) to the state of order.

The State Formation Process in Nigeria: The Early Stages

Nigeria came into being neither through the efforts of an indigenous empire builder nor by the resolution of a constituent assembly convoked by the people with the aim of creating for themselves a state. At no time did Nigerians gather to “give themselves a constitution” delimiting the powers and obligations of rulers. Nigeria emerged when a foreign conquering power, Great Britain, subdued, pacified, and incrementally merged hitherto autonomous, stand-alone, possibly, reciprocally antagonistic tribes into a federation of nationalities.

Pre-Colonial System of Government

It is not as if the “primitive” tribes lacked systems of government and social control. The Hausa-Fulani and Bornu societies, as Lugard discovered, were under one form of centralized rule or the other. The hierarchical structure in Hausa-Fulani states placed the Sultan (Sarkin Musulumi or Leader of the Faithful) at the apex of the Caliphate. Below him were the Emirs in charge of provinces, the District Heads posted to districts, and the Village Heads assigned to villages and hamlets. The lower-level officials served as the “eyes and ears” of their superiors, in much the same way as the enderassies (provincial governors) did in Imperial Ethiopia. More or less the same pattern prevailed in Bornu where the Mai (later Shehu) sat atop the Kanem Empire.

Powerful as he was, neither the Sultan nor any of the Emirs ruled alone. Each was assisted by high-ranking officials and advisers. A corps of specialized personnel performed essential functions in Islamic states. Ma’aji, the Treasurer, supervised the Treasury, and the Alkalis decided criminal and civil matters by applying the Shari’a legal code. Dogaris and Yandokas (police constables) maintained law and order, while minor court officials ministered to the needs of the palace. Other officials were designated to collect haraji (poll tax) and jangali (cattle tax). The Ma’allams imparted religious education at the madrassas, taught Arabic to those seeking exposure to Middle Eastern literature and to non-Western sources of knowledge, or tutored adults unable to master Arabic grammar on how to read and write Ajami, basically, Hausa texts written in Arabic characters.
In the south-West, mid-West, and the Niger Delta, the inhabitants came under the rule of paramount rulers, among them the Oni of Ife, the Oba of Bini, the Alaafin of Oyo, the Olu of Warri, the Awujale of Ijebuland, the Alake of Egba, and the King of Bonny. However, none of the paramount rulers exercised any authority that rivalled that of an Emir. Where an Emir was empowered to issue general and specific directives to lower-level officials (District and Village Heads), a typical Yoruba Oba’s authority over subordinate chiefs (like the Baales, the local equivalents of District, Village, Ward, and Clan Heads) was titular rather than real.

The centralized system of government in the Hausa-Fulani and the Yoruba, Edo, and allied societies stood in stark contrast to the system adopted in segmented, “stateless” Igbo and Tiv societies. Among the “tribes without rulers”, authority to regulate social behaviour and discharge essential functions is shared among various institutions, especially, clan heads, councils of elders, age-grades, secret societies, priests, medicine men, and ad hoc vigilante groups.

Regardless of the system of government in vogue at any time or place, and with the possible exception of the Islamic states under Shari’a law, authority to rule rested not on law or reason, but on a mixture of personal charisma, encoded myths, superstitions, and “the ways of the ancestors.” Naturally, conflict frequently arose over how to respond to ongoing challenges in light of the gods’ decrees and the spirit mediums’ interpretations.

Rudiments of Modern Administration

The seeds of a nation later known as Nigeria were sown in the nineteenth century. At the initial stages, private commercial interests teamed up with the Crown to establish the rudiments of public administration. For instance, in 1879, a number of British trading firms competing with their French counterparts came together, with an initial capital of £125,000, to form the United Africa Company, UAC. Shortly thereafter, another firm, the National African Company, NAC, opened for business. On 10 July 1886, NAC was granted a royal charter and its name was changed to the Royal Niger Company, Chartered and Limited.

The Royal Niger Company doubled as a business enterprise and as surrogate government. Besides engaging in normal commercial activities, it maintained law and order within its territory, imposed taxes, collected custom duties, organized a modern police force, and established a network of courts. This was to be expected. After the Berlin Conference of 1884/85 settled the European powers’ claims to African territories, Great Britain, unable to mobilize the resources needed to administer its own share of the loot, devolved overseas state formation and construction responsibility “to those who were willing and anxious to accept it.” (Kirk-Greene, op. cit., p. 262)

Great Britain did not cede total control of its territory to the Royal Niger Company. Before the Company was granted a royal charter, Britain had maintained a token presence in coastal areas and parts of the interior. Precisely, in 1860, a British consul was posted to Lokoja, and a year later, Great Britain
formally annexed Lagos. Thereafter, British commercial interests and the slowly emerging colonial administration jointly embarked on a combination of military conquest, diplomacy, and ‘pacification’ (Balogun, 1983:69).

The indigenous populations did not give up without a fight. In the delta area, local chiefs led the resistance against foreign incursion. The Royal Niger Company, in particular, had to call in troops to suppress local armed insurrections. To ensure lasting peace in the Oil Rivers area, it sent King Jaja of Opobo into exile in the West Indies in or around 1887. Other chiefs that were either pacified or subdued were King William Pepple of Bonny (1854), Chief Nana of Jekris (1894) and the Oba of Benin (1897).

In 1900, Great Britain formally assumed responsibility for the administration of Nigeria. It not only took over all the territories hitherto administered by commercial enterprises, but also carved them into three Protectorates—the Niger Coast/Southern Protectorate, the Lagos Colony, and the Protectorate of Northern Nigeria. Each was, to all intents and purposes and on account of its diverse character, governed as a separate and autonomous entity.

As a cost-saving measure, Britain experimented with the system of Indirect Rule—one entrusting the administration of local communities to existing traditional institutions, and leaving broad policy in the hands of the colonial administration. The experiment succeeded in the North, was tried and quickly discarded in the south-West, but it failed woefully in the segmented societies of the East.

While pledging to keep the indigenous institutions intact, Lugard did not totally renounce Lord Curzon’s pledge, which was essentially to carry “civilization, humanity, peace, good government and Christianity” to the farthest end of the earth (Allen & Unwin:1963). Lugard thus proceeded to reorganize the traditional system of government. He established five grades of chiefs (each with an insignia of the Crown’s authority), clearly defined the chiefs’ powers and functions in a Native Authorities Proclamation, and laid down general norms of behaviour. In 1904, he introduced a single system of indirect taxation in place of the variety of taxes imposed by emirs and chiefs, and in 1911 he established the first set of regular native treasuries. In no time, the traditional rulers became the colonial regime’s agents and active collaborators, basically, the instruments to mobile local support for colonial rule.

If Indirect Rule entailed tinkering with the traditional system of administration in the North, the conditions prevailing in the Colony and the Southern Protectorates warranted a radical break from the past. Lagos, with its flourishing trade and an annual turnover of £500,000, could afford to establish modern institutions. In the Yoruba societies of the Southern Protectorate, Governor MacGregor had started by relying on the Obas (traditional rulers) and their councils for advice. He soon veered towards direct rule.

In 1901, MacGregor promulgated a Native Authority Ordinance setting up provincial and district councils, and a central Native Council to advise the British on Yoruba traditions. All the councils were closely monitored. A traditional ruler who exceeded or abused his authority was liable to be summarily deposed. Like their Northern counterparts, the Southern chiefs were co-opted into the foreign rulers’ apparatus of control.
In the Niger Coast (Southern) Protectorate, Sir Claude Macdonald and Sir Ralph Moor relied on traditional institutions but ensured that the operators were schooled in the British concept of “natural law and morality”. In 1900, he brought all the native courts under the supervision of a local British supreme court and repealed all “unjust and barbarous” laws.

The segmented units in the eastern enclave of the Southern Protectorate were not easily adaptable to the requirements of Indirect Rule. The ‘house’ system was originally expected to relieve the Protectorate administration of the drudgery of day-to-day administration. However, as authority did not reside in a single potentate but was diffused among segments (e.g., elders, age sets, secret societies, clans and kinship groups), the British looked everywhere for a “chief” but found none. The first person that stepped forward was promptly recognized as a “chief”, appointed “by warrant” and given a “staff/instrument of office”. The experiment soon ended in disaster. Lacking popular support or legitimacy, the warrant chiefs antagonized their “subjects”, dented the image of the colonial administration, and contributed largely to the Aba riots of 1929 (Balogun, 1983: 72).

By 1914, the Protectorate administrations had found solutions to many of their teething problems. On the first of January that year, the Protectorates of the South, the North and Lagos Colony were amalgamated into a state named Nigeria (coined from “Niger area”).

The absence of local political control devolved huge responsibility on the colonial rulers to swear an oath of allegiance to the new state’s founder, the British Crown; introducing a new colonial badge consisting of interlaced triangles known as “Solomon’s seal”; issuance of a single weekly gazette carrying official news and supplements; replacing the protectorate administrations’ “general orders” with a uniform set of standing orders; and standardizing printed forms and stationery.

Legality became the new state’s organizing principle. To pave the way for the ‘authoritative allocation of values’ and legitimize the actions of the emerging colonial bureaucracy, the government was formally established by Letters Patent and other Instruments. Under the new order, the Governor-General became virtual head of government with the power to preside over the Executive Council, direct and control government departments, and liaise with the Colonial Secretary in London.

The Southern and the Northern Protectorates were re-named ‘provinces’ under the control of two Lieutenant Governors. Each was responsible for the administration of areas under his jurisdiction. He supervised the activities of the departments in the provincial secretariat. As the office of Minister did not exist, each Head of Department doubled as chief executive and de facto policy maker. In defiance of the doctrine of Separation of Powers, the Legal and Judicial Department was one of those reporting directly to the Governor. The provincial court which, according to Chief Justice Willoughby Osborne, “brings English justice practically to the door of everyone”, was itself an appendage of the colonial bureaucracy, as all political officers and other officers so designated were commissioners of the court.

The absence of local political control
bureaucracy. Even though a Nigerian Council was established in 1919, substantive executive authority remained with the Governor. In 1922, a Legislative Council was created (for the Colony and the Southern Provinces). However, of the forty-five members, only four were elected; the rest were the Governor’s nominees. In any case, the Council exercised no legislative oversight over the executive and the bureaucracy. The Executive Council (comprising the Chief Secretary, the Attorney-General, the Financial Secretary, the Commandant of the Nigerian Regiment, and the Heads of specialized Departments) continued for a long time to dispose of high-level policy matters without reference to any legislature. The excuse given for bypassing the Legislative Council was that it was a “veiled oligarchy” which needed to be checked by the executive’s “responsible autocracy”.

The March Towards Self-rule

The colonial regime’s “responsible autocracy” itself did not go unchallenged. First, the Nigerian Youth Movement, led by Herbert Macaulay, passed up no opportunity to attack alien rule and demand immediate transfer of power to the people’s representatives. When the Movement split in 1941, Dr Nnamdi Azikiwe joined a faction that, in 1944, became the “National Council of Nigeria and the Cameroon”, NCNC(NCNC:1960). To check the NCNC’s expansion in the Yoruba south-West, Chief Obafemi Awolowo and other prominent members of the Egbe Omo Oduduwa, which is a Yoruba cultural organisation formed the Action Group, AG, in 1950. Not to be left behind, the alumni of the Katsina College, led by Ahmadu Bello a member of the Sokoto royal family, transformed their own cultural organization, Jam’iyyar Mutanen Arewa into the Northern People’s Congress, NPC, in 1951. Over time, the three political parties became forces to reckon with. However, they were mostly regionally based parties, with the NCNC controlling the East, the AG the West, and the NPC the North.

Meanwhile, the Richards Constitution of 1947 had provided for the establishment of a Central Legislative Council and a House of Chiefs for the Northern and the Southern Provinces. In 1951, the Macpherson Constitution introduced elements of representative government along with the ministerial system of government.

The promulgation of the Lyttelton Constitution in 1954 capped the colonial authorities’ state formation and maintenance efforts in Nigeria. Azikiwe became Premier of the East, Awolowo, that of the West, and Ahmadu Bello, the Northern Premier. From then on, indigenous political elites were to assume increasing responsibility for the governance of the country, including the responsibility for policy formulation, executive leadership of Ministries, approval of the traditional rulers’ appointments and regulation of their conduct.

Expansion in Scope of Government

Due to budget constraints, the earliest period of colonial rule in Nigeria was one of ‘lean government’. In 1913, a year before amalgamation, the total revenue of the Nigerian government as a whole was £3.4 million, while total expenditure stood at £2.9 million. Government revenue increased from £2.2million in 1912 to £5.5 million in 1922. Within the same 10-year period, recurrent expenditure jumped from £2.1 million to £6.5 million.
Notwithstanding the fiscal constraints, the colonial bureaucracy led initial efforts at enhancing citizen identity with the embryonic state. It constructed roads, bridges, and a network of railways, administered education and health programmes, provided agricultural extension services, and above all, maintained law and order. The construction of the 847-mile Western railway line, linking Iddo in the South with Nguru in the North, commenced in 1893. In 1905, the first motor road in Nigeria was constructed to link Ibadan with Oyo. By the early 1930s, the Public Works Department had constructed over 3,700 miles of roads across Nigeria.

In 1945, the colonial administration launched a ten-year programme of reconstruction and development at a total cost of £55 million. This was made up of £23 million in colonial development and welfare grants, £16 million in loan funds, and another £16 million from local revenue sources (Balogun:1983).

The scope of public administration expanded rapidly from then on. Thus, on the attainment of independence on 1st October 1960, the Federal and the Regional Governments launched the First National Development Plan spanning the period 1962-1968. Implementing the Plan warranted the creation of new agencies, the recruitment of additional staff, and, as to be expected, expenditure increases. The cycle was repeated with the launching of the Second National Development Plan, 1970-74. Although prudent spending kept public expenditure in check during the three-year civil war, the situation changed dramatically with the inauguration of an ambitious post-war programme of reconstruction, resettlement, rehabilitation and development.

The Second Development Plan set aside the sum of N600 million (approximately US$900 million at the then prevailing exchange rate) to replace the assets and rebuild the infrastructure destroyed during the civil war. It further earmarked a total of N2.05 billion for public investment, and another N3.43 billion for private sector development. The oil windfall was expended on a variety of projects, and the establishment of new agencies. The government acquired majority shareholding in commercial banks. It also sold insurance policies, ran supermarkets, engaged in retail and wholesale trade, provided shipping and port administration services, and acquired additional aircraft for the national career.

The push to “modernize” continued under the military regime only to be slowed down by structural imbalances. By the 1980s, budget overruns had started having serious fiscal and macro-economic implications. In no time, the federal and the state governments were compelled to swallow the bitter bill of structural adjustment. As part of the austerity measures instituted from the 1980s, the currency was devalued, public agencies were either merged or abolished, agricultural subsidies were withdrawn, novel revenue mobilization methods were explored, and public spending was drastically reduced.

The Civil Service’s Role in the Evolution of Modern Nigeria: an Appraisal

Contemporary Nigeria has passed through a number of phases—phases that are significantly different from those traversed by the colonists. Having been pacified, subjugated, amalgamated, and latter clothed with the garb of constitutionalism, post-colonial Nigeria went through the stages of institution building, institution decay, military
intervention, institution regeneration and “civilianization”, and, as noted in the final section, system decomposition. The role as well as the fate of the civil service was closely tied to these vicissitudes.

**Institution Building**

The high points of the institution building phase are the “Nigerianization” of the higher civil service, the wholesale transplant of Western forms of government onto the Nigerian soil, and the adoption of the Westminster civil service norms and practices (like professionalism, anonymity, non-partisanship, accountability, integrity, and security of tenure).

Up to 1948, the higher civil service remained the exclusive preserve of Europeans. As at that year, only 172 senior posts were occupied by Nigerians out of a total of 22,071. The Nigerianization process gathered momentum when the Foot-Adebo Commission proposed additional measures. However, while the process proceeded rapidly in the East, the West and, to a certain extent, at the Federal level, the Northern Region lagged behind in the “Nigerianization” of its civil service, preferring to give priority to “Northernization”. In 1958, only 48.1 percent of Federal civil service posts at the senior level were occupied by Nigerians. This contrasts sharply with Western Region’s 74.9 percent. By 1963, the percentage of senior posts encumbered by Nigerians had risen to 89.5 in the Western Region and to 87.0 at the federal level.

As Nigerians assumed increasing responsibility for the running of the civil service, the political leaders (those who fought for and “brought in” independence) were consolidating their positions. In 1957, Sir Abubakar Tafawa Balewa was sworn in as federal Prime Minister. This coincided with the period when the Eastern and the Western Regions attained internal self-government and were under the effective control of their Premiers (Nnamdi Azikiwe in the East, and Obafemi Awolowo in the West). The North (led by Premier Sir Ahmadu Bello) did not become internally self-governing until 15th March 1959.

Frictions frequently arose between, on the one hand, Ministers who were the political heads of Ministries, and on the other, senior career officials. While the former placed high premium on political loyalty, the latter flinched from any suggestion to bend towards a political direction. The only possible exceptions were the police, and the customary courts. Police officers and customary court judges had little problem moving against the opposition, and/or looking the other way when politically connected persons broke the law. All the overzealous officials needed to act was their political masters’ nod or frown, as the case might be. This has adverse consequences for the integrity of the inherited institutions, for the service delivery capacity of the civil service, and for identity value of citizenship.

**Institutional Decay, Rehabilitation, and Relapse**

The 1962 crisis in the Action Group (which culminated in the declaration of a state of emergency in the Western Region) undermined the integrity and effectiveness of public service institutions. The deeper the Region sank into crisis, the greater the pressure on the career civil service to dance to the tune of the ruling party. Unfortunately, rather than abate, the crisis soon engulfed the whole of Nigeria, culminating in the Major’s coup of January 1966, the assassination of prominent Northern and Western leaders and military
officers, the breakdown of civil order and the massacre of Igbos during the “Ar-raba” riots, the declaration of the Igbo-led Eastern Region as an independent state of Biafra, and the prosecution of a three-year civil war. Throughout the volatile years, the civil service played a critical role in stabilizing the wobbly ship of state, and in re-establishing the authority of the Nigerian state. In fact, had a few federal civil servants not been vigilant, the centrifugal clauses inserted in the Aburi Accord would have turned Nigeria into a loose confederation, and ultimately split the country into autonomous, ethnic-based states.

The civil service played an equally decisive role during the military era. With the politicians sent packing, the lot of formulating policy initially fell on senior civil servants but was later shared with politically non-aligned “Commissioners” (Ministers). The civil servants’ role intensified pari passu with the expansion in the scope of public administration. The erstwhile anonymity of the civil service vanished as senior career officials made public pronouncements on government policy. “Super Permanent Secretaries” were so powerful that no major decisions were taken without their knowledge and/or inputs. It was therefore not surprising that the Permanent Secretaries and other high-ranking civil servants became a target of attack. They were among the 10,000 public officials that were summarily removed as part of the Purge carried out by the Murtala Mohammed regime in 1975.

The shake-up of the public service made it difficult taming that beast known as corruption—a beast that the Buhari-Idiagbon regime fought relentlessly between 1984 and 1985, but which returned with a vengeance under the Ibrahim Babangida and the Sani Abacha military regimes (1985-1998), as well as the civilian government that has ruled Nigeria since 1999.

Under normal circumstances, Nigeria’s heterogeneity should be a source of the country’s strength. Heterogeneity should foster openness and pluralism. Regrettably, it has, in the hands of cynics, turned into post-colonial Nigeria’s albatross. On the pretext that they are championing the interests of “their” people, howsoever defined, transactional leaders have established their suzerainty over the public space prior to personalizing and manipulating government structures, acts and decisions.

Politicization rears its ugly head at different stages of state formation, but most especially at that of personnel recruitment. A public service post falls vacant, but before open competitive processes are exhausted and candidates are transparently assessed against the expected deliverables, an all-out war breaks out pitching one interest against another. Each contesting bloc never gives up until it applies methods fair and foul to have its man on the job. The ‘federal character’ provisions of the constitution have been grossly abused, with top government functionaries (from the President, through Ministers, to Senators) hiding behind them to fill key vacancies with their children, relatives, party stalwarts, and other highly connected candidates.

The Civil Service and Nigeria’s Future: A Summation

The first generation of leaders acknowledged as self-evident the link between, on one hand, the implementation of inclusive policies and, on the other, identification with the Nigerian population. They understood that inclusion must necessarily go hand-in-hand with representation. The new millennium, however, saw the Nigerian state not as a beacon of national pride, but as a source of financial gain to an elite few. The leader of this new generation of statesmen, who had been promised a better life by the foregoing generation, now used the system as an instrument of personal gain.
state. They realized that it was not enough to “bring in independence” or to act as if they were the conquering armies that created and “owned” the state. As the inheritors of the sovereign powers of the post-colonial state, they knew they had to show some tangible results—at least, within their regions.

The colonial rulers’ immediate successors were particularly keen on sustaining the “modernization” process. They invested in education, health, irrigation, agricultural extension, and infrastructural development projects. The Western Region prided itself on being the first to establish Africa’s television station (WNBS/WNTS) and to construct Tropical Africa’s first skyscraper (Cocoa House also in Ibadan).4

The Northern Region opened schools and colleges imparting Western knowledge, while retaining the madrassas for Arabic and Islamic studies. It built hospitals, clinics and rural health centres; implemented irrigation and water development projects; provided veterinary and animal health services; and supported the farming communities with credit, advisory and storage facilities. Kano’s cotton and groundnuts pyramids were indeed a testimony to the North Regional Government’s agricultural development efforts. The Eastern Region was not left behind. It too implemented an ambitious programme of modernization and development.

The later-day leaders are different from their predecessors. With the possible exception of the short-lived Murtala Mohammed regime and the Buhari-Idiagbon government both of which waged a war on indiscipline, succeeding generations of leaders have placed greater premium on the capture and retention of power than on qualitative change in governance and in people’s living standards (Ake, 1994). To capture or retain power, the new-breed leaders employ a mix of outright manipulation of the electoral process, violence, bribery, deceit, and flagrant abuse of the ‘power of incumbency’. Their record to-date in combating that menace called corruption has been dismal.

Top judicial officials are openly accused of delaying and denying justice through needless adjournments, selling favourable verdicts to the highest bidder, and undermining the rule of law. Corruption is as rife in the police as it is endemic in the country as a whole. In its 2011 report, Transparency International notes that Nigerian civil servants took bribes amounting to N450 billion (roughly $3 billion) during the 2010/2011 fiscal year alone. It consistently ranks the country low on its Corruption Perception Index (CPI). In September 2014, vigilant airport officials in South Africa detained a Nigerian plane laden with hard currency (wads of crispy new notes totalling $9.3 million). Since the amount was not declared, the organized crimes unit of the government stepped in. Before the situation got out of hand, but to the embarrassment of Nigerians, their government owned up to collusion in the plainly illegal act. And that was just one of such acts, the one that came to light!

The future of Nigeria hinges on the leaders’ determination to reform the civil service and reposition it for the challenges of state formation and maintenance. Reform efforts need to go beyond high-profile ministerial rationalization and downsizing. Re-engineering structures and processes for integrity, productivity and improved service delivery should be the highpoints of future reforms. Reform will only be meaningful if

---

4 The first African to hold the post of Speaker of a legislative assembly (Samuel Ade Ojo) also belonged to the Western Region.
the civil service bureaucracy steadily moves away from the spoils system to one anchored on merit. Career officials should be able to discharge their constitutionally mandated obligations without undue partisan political pressure. Anything less would impair the civil service’s capacity to implement inclusive programmes, programmes that strengthen citizen allegiance to the state.

References


Nigerian Handbook, Tenth edn, 1933 (Lagos: Government Printer)


White Paper on the Reorganization of Ministries, West Regional Legislature, Sessional Paper no. 2, 1959
Integration and Inclusivity: Fundamentals for Transformation of Governance and Public Administration in Africa

Bashi Mothusi¹

Abstract

This article discusses ways and means through which public administration can be transformed in Africa through embracing the two fundamental concepts of “integration and inclusivity”. It starts by briefly discussing the introduction of MDGs and a shift towards SDGs and Agenda 2063 which requires countries to change the manner in which they conduct their business. It also discusses the two concepts of integration and inclusivity as well as indicates their importance in terms of enhancing good governance. The article also presents a brief discussion on the concepts of governance and good governance and captures the five things that ought to be done to promote integration and inclusivity which are fundamentals for the transformation of public administration in Africa.

Key words: Innovation, Integration, Inclusivity, Governance and Transformation

Introduction

The pursuance of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and Agenda 2063 has necessitated the realignment of government institutions with a view to making them more transparent, accountable, efficient and effective in service delivery. The political landscape has had to embrace democracy as a form of governance where all citizens can be placed at the centre of the development process and actively participate in the decision making. On the economic front, the realignment of African economies ensured that all citizens participate and benefit from various economic activities undertaken by the government, private sector entities and non-profit making organisations. Additionally, the culture of citizens and the manner in which various issues have been conceptualised and operationalised had to change to accommodate emerging expectations, needs, demands and aspirations. In 2000, the United Nations General Assembly presented concrete and specific development goals and targets to improve the lives of all citizens across the world. The main aim of these goals, which are commonly referred to a Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), was to free humanity from extreme poverty; illiteracy; gender inequality; high child mortality rates; HIV and AIDS, malaria and other debilitating diseases; environmental degradation as well as weak and unfair trading partnerships among countries by 2015.

MDGs and a Shift towards SDGs and Agenda 2063

Different countries around the world and different regional blocs embarked on a journey

¹University of Botswana
to achieve the aforementioned Millennium Development Goals. Resources were mobilised and the pursuance of these goals yielded different results for different countries and regions. For example, in March 2013, a review of the performance of SADC countries revealed that they were likely to meet the 2015 targets for two MDGs, which are MDG 2: achieving universal primary education, and MDG 6: combating HIV and AIDS, malaria and other diseases (Chipika & Malaba, 2013:xi-xix). The review further revealed that the SADC region has made remarkable progress for most targets in MDG 3: promoting gender equality and empowerment of women; MDG 4: reducing child mortality; and MDG 8: developing a global partnership for development. Hence, a conclusion was made that the region has registered satisfactory progress in five out of the eight MDGs.

The same review clearly indicated that the performance of SADC member states under three MDGs was below par. These MDGs are MDG 1: eradicating extreme poverty and hunger; MDG 5: improving maternal health; MDG 6: the fight against malaria and TB and MDG 7: ensuring environmental sustainability. The ability to achieve or failure to achieve these goals by different member states was greatly influenced by political, economic, administrative, legal, socio-cultural factors (Chipika & Malaba, 2013:xi-xix).

When recognising that almost all countries around the world would not be able to attain all the MDGs by 2015, the UN General Assembly presented a new agenda in 2015 which ushered in Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) 2030 and Agenda 2063. The year 2016 marked the beginning of a transition period from MDGs to SDGs and Agenda 2063. There are 17 SDGs, some of which are an extension of the MDGs. The report titled “MDGs to Agenda 2063/SDGs Transition Report 2016” presents the underpinnings of Agenda 2063 succinctly by stating that:

“Agenda 2063 is a long-term development framework that aims to materialize the vision of: an integrated, prosperous and peaceful Africa, driven by its own citizens and representing a dynamic force in the world. It is anchored by seven aspirations that are supported by corresponding goals, priority areas, targets, and strategies (MDGs to Agenda 2063/SDGs Transition Report, 2016:13)

Agenda 2063 places citizens at the centre of the development process. This is not surprising because a concerted effort has been made to spread democracy to all parts of the world and African countries have moved away from one party systems and apartheid to multi-party democracy.

The SDGs 2030 and Agenda 2063 place an expectation on countries to align their National Development Plans (NDPs) with the global development goals. NDPs are usually a compilation of all the policy issues that the government intends to address over a given period of time. These include problems or challenges faced by citizens with regard to health, education, sanitation, transportation, tourism, environmental protection, food insecurity, terrorism, rule of law and others. Hence, projects to be implemented in response to the identified challenges are usually reflected in the NDPs. Aligning the NDPs with SDGs and Agenda 2063 means that countries must realign or restructure their institutions as well as change the manner in which public policies are formulated and implemented.
What Good Governance Entails

The concept of governance is simply defined by Kettl (2002:xi) as “the way government gets its job done”. Similar sentiments have been expressed by de Vries (2013:4) when he says that, “The simplest definition of governance is nothing else than the conduct of government”. It is about how government departments and ministries conduct their business, how decisions are made and how resources are allocated. All these things depend on how power is exercised within public organisations. Grindle (2010:2) sums it up succinctly by saying that governance refers to the institutional underpinnings of public authority and decision making. In this way, governance encompasses the institutions, systems, “rules of the game” and other factors that determine how political and economic interactions are structured and how decisions are made and resources allocated.

The foregoing definitions of governance are important because they do not only set the tone for the definition of the concept of “good governance”, but they also remind us of government’s responsibility and obligation to provide citizens with public goods and services in the form of education, health care, safe drinking water, sanitation, provision of security, protection of property rights, telecommunications, street lighting and others. Since these services are provided on a daily basis, it is of paramount importance that we understand how they are delivered and how public organisations are structured. In the same vein, it is also important to establish if the allocation of national resources is done in an efficient and effective way and if administrators and political leaders are not appropriating national resources to themselves. And lastly, we need to find out or establish the extent to which citizens are involved in decisions or public policy making processes.

The manner in which we respond to the aforementioned issues or the answers that we get go a long way in indicating whether there is good or bad governance within countries. As Wunsch (2014:5) states; “The governance problem revolves around chronic corruption, rent seeking, inability to deliver services to the grassroots, poor maintenance of public infrastructure, poor implementation of public programs, and lack of initiative at local levels”. These things are signs or indicators of bad governance whereas the positive ones are deemed to be indicators of good governance.

In a report titled “The State of Governance in Botswana 2004,” the Botswana Institute for Development Policy Analysis (BIDPA) defines good governance as “predictable, open, and enlightened policy making; a bureaucracy imbued with professional ethos; an executive arm that is accountable for its actions, and a strong civil society participating in public affairs” (BIDPA, 2006:36). The report goes further to identify the critical ingredients of good governance such as transparency, openness, accountability, fairness, equity, respect for the rule of law, consistency and coherence in policy formation, high standards of ethical behaviour, prudent management of economic resources, participation, and equitable distribution of resources.

In view of the foregoing, Grindle (2010:2) states that the popularity of the concept of good governance can be attributed to the positive images that it embodies. These positive images are about the good things that countries are expected to do to improve people’s standard of living through formulation and implementation of relevant public policies, engaging citizens in
the policy making process, reducing poverty and inequalities, strengthening of public institutions, conducting government business in a transparent manner, holding public servants accountable for their decisions and actions, minimising or eliminating corruption and others.

Integration and Inclusivity: Fundamentals for Good Governance

The two concepts are about concerted efforts that are made by the political and administrative leaders to involve citizens, private sector entities and civil society organisations in the decision making and policy making process. Citizens know best what their needs, demands, expectations and aspirations are. And in a democratic society, they have the right to partake in decisions that affect them directly and indirectly. Hence, it is of paramount importance that equal opportunities must be availed to all citizens irrespective of sex, educational level, tribe, political affiliation, economic status, physical ability or disability and others to contribute to the decision and policy making processes. In other words, all citizens must be placed at the center of the process of national development if the process is to be legitimised and owned by the citizens. They must be viewed as partners in the process of national development rather than as passive recipients of goods and services provided by public organisations.

In view of the foregoing, it is important that the relationship between government and citizens must be changed from one where the former is the primary agent whose main responsibility is to provide services to the latter to one of mutualilty and reciprocity (European Union, 2015:38). There must be mutual respect and understanding for what each is worth and capable of contributing. Hence, there is need for the government to create an environment that encourages citizens to organise and govern themselves by initiating, implementing and managing their developmental projects with a view to complementing the efforts made by the government. The integration and inclusion of citizens and private sector organisations in the policy making process can be demonstrated by making reference to an observation made by the European Union (2015:47) when it states that;

“The consultation of the ultimate beneficiaries of the public policy, both citizens and businesses, should provide crucial inputs throughout the policy process. The interests of good governance are served by the intended beneficiaries being integral to all steps in policy-making, not just as an end recipient of government programmes, funds and services”.

Private sector and civil society organisations must be viewed and treated as partners in the process of national development rather than as substitutes for the state or government. Hence, the government of the day must formulate and implement policies that are geared towards creating an environment that is conducive to the operations of the two actors. They must be given space to innovate and reinvent themselves in light of the ever changing environment in which they exist and operate.

In the same vein, Batalli (2011:159) argues that leaders at the national and local levels can find out what the citizens want by constantly conversing with them through the use of various tools. As she puts it; “Leaders must find ways to engage all citizens by developing
better and more frequent use of old tools such as surveys, advisory committees, performance review committees, and community forums to make participation more meaningful”.

An important observation made by Alberti & Bertucci (2006:6) is that in an attempt to enhance good governance, the focus has now shifted from what kinds of services are provided by government agencies to how they are supposed to be provided. There is no disagreement in terms of what the government has to do. But what is of paramount importance is how it executes its mandate. Alberti & Bertucci (2006:6-7) capture this shift aptly when they state that;

“Back-office operations are no longer the decisive factor of where the citizen needs to go; instead these operations are tied together by either integrating early in the value chain or by bundling services together in a single entry point for the citizens.”

Improved service delivery has been done in countries like the Philippines, Brazil, Portugal, Mozambique and South Africa through the establishment of one-stop shops placed in places that are convenient for citizens such as public malls and public transportation hubs (Alberti & Bertucci, 2006:7). Multiple goods and services can be provided at these shops and it is a convenient and a cost-effective way of providing for and responding to the needs of citizens.

The goals and ideals of integration and inclusivity cannot be realised if there is no assessment and realignment of administrative and political organisations existing on the African continent. Hence, there is need to shed light on the concept of innovation which is about embracing technology as well as restructuring public organisations.

The Need for Innovation

Innovation is not only about embracing new technology. It is also about restructuring and realigning political and administrative institutions with a view to making them more responsive to the needs of the citizens, more transparent and more accountable. Batalli (2011:156) explains innovation as a process that is always on-going and goes further to explain that, “As an ongoing process, the public administration innovation includes the decentralizing of public administration, simplifying of procedures, informatization of the service delivery and improving human resource developments”.

It is clear from the foregoing quotation that public administration innovation is about establishing and empowering administrative agencies at the provincial and local levels, reducing bureaucratic red-tape, making information available to citizens regarding the services that are provided by government departments as well as training and developing the skills of all public servants. It is important for public servants to be given an opportunity to think outside the box. They must be allowed to think of creative ways of addressing the complex social, economic, political and cultural issues that are presented before them on daily basis (European Union, 2015:23).

Innovation is also about putting in place mechanisms that will ensure that there is enhanced transparency and accountability. Public servants must not only account for their decisions and actions, but they should also account for the quality of service that they render to the citizens (Batalli, 2011:156). Citizens have the right to quality goods and services.
Below is a discussion of five issues that both political and administrative leaders in Africa must pay attention to if the pursuance of SDGs and Agenda 2063 is to yield any positive results. The list is not exhaustive as the transformation of public institutions is an on-going process and can never be stopped at any stage simply because certain goals and objectives have been achieved.

a. Realignment of Government Institutions

Public servants are expected to conduct their business in a transparent manner. They are expected to follow rules, regulations and procedures which govern their decisions and actions within public offices. By the same token, they are expected to account for and take responsibility for their decisions and actions. They must account to their administrative supervisors, politicians and most importantly to citizens. Unfortunately, in most of the developing countries, public servants do not serve citizens to the best of their abilities. Rather, they expect citizens to be their servants and sometimes behave as if they are doing them (citizens) a favour by rendering certain services to them. This calls for a paradigm shift, a change of mind-set and a change of organisational culture where public servants must be constantly reminded of the facilitatory or midwifery role that they are supposed to play in the process of national development.

There is need to inculcate a culture of high performance in public organisations including public enterprises. This calls for the formulation and implementation of strategies that can be used to manage public policies and programmes effectively in an ever-changing environment. The ability to adapt to the turbulent environment will enable public organisations to move away from the traditional bureaucracies which are structured and staffed in such a manner that they can only conduct their business in a traditional way. They need to be structured in such a manner that they can promptly respond to the ever-changing needs and demands of citizens as well as be in a position to handle and manage the demands placed on them by the process of globalisation (Kettl, 2002:146). This calls for a change in the structure of public organisations and most importantly, the training of public servants with a view to ensuring that they have the requisite skills and expertise to formulate and implement evidence-based policies. In terms of training, Kettl (2002:147) is of the view that the schools of public affairs, public administration and public policy must also change their programmes or curriculum to align them with the needs of present day public servants. These public servants must be agile for them to respond to the needs and demands of citizens who are more informed about their rights, what the government is obliged to provide in the form of goods and services, how they can be held accountable and others.

The realignment of government institutions also calls for the strengthening of oversight institutions so that they can perform their responsibilities satisfactorily. Strengthening oversight institutions is very important in terms of enhancing good governance and reducing the high rates of corruption across African countries. They must, therefore, be given constitutional protection as well as power and authority to perform their duties and functions without fear or favour. They must be given the resources that they need in the form of skilled manpower, funds, technology, equipment and others. This will go a long way in enhancing accountability, transparency and ethical leadership in the public sector which
will, in the long run, result in citizens having more confidence and trust in the government of the day.

The realignment of government institutions will not yield any positive results if we do not pay attention to the role played by leaders in these organisations. Strategic, ethical and transformational leadership must be at the centre of everything that is happening in public organisations. Leaders must be alive to the fact that they are expected to do the right things and serve their subordinates and citizens to the best of their ability. They must go an extra mile in terms of service delivery and they must take their subordinates and citizens with them on this journey.

b. Strive for Genuine Decentralisation

The process of decentralisation has been embraced to varying degrees and in different forms in different countries depending on the political system in place. In some countries such as South Africa and Nigeria, there are three layers or levels: national, provincial and local government levels. The national government formulates public policies and they are implemented by provincial and local government agencies. In other countries like Botswana and Namibia, there are two levels: the national and local government levels. Just like under a three tier system, the national government usually formulates and implements public policies as well as delegates the implementation part to local government agencies.

In view of the important role played by local government institutions in the policy making process and service delivery, it is of paramount importance that they should be strengthened and empowered. As entities existing and operating closer to the citizens, they are better placed to identify as well as respond appropriately and promptly to the needs, demands and aspirations of the citizens. But most importantly, they are better placed to involve all citizens including women, those who are economically disadvantaged and people living with disabilities in the decision making process. They provide an important umbilical cord between the national government and the citizens, thus contributing towards the promotion of good governance.

There is need to move against recentralisation of service delivery. For example, in Botswana, urban and district councils used to provide safe drinking water and health care to the citizens. Provision of these services was transferred to the Ministry of Minerals, Energy and Water Resources and Ministry of Health and Wellness in 2009 respectively thus affecting negatively the power and pride of the councils.

Prior to centralisation of the two aforementioned services, citizens were not presented with any concrete evidence that indicated that failure to centralise the same will result in a catastrophe. In other words, the policy makers failed to create or arouse what Schein (2004:4) refers to as “survival anxiety”, which is a feeling that our organisations will fail to achieve their goals and objectives if we do not embrace change. This requires presentation of evidence or data to members of the organisations or society so that they can realise and appreciate that change is unavoidable.

It is very common in many countries for local authorities to be given unfunded mandates. In other words, they are given responsibilities and functions without the requisite resources to deliver. This is a strategy, perhaps deliberate,
by the political and administrative leaders to frustrate local authorities, portray them in a bad light and continue to have full control over them. But given the closeness of these authorities to the citizens, a concerted effort must be made to empower them. They must be given the space to grow and develop into vibrant entities that can actively participate in the process of national development rather than to be turned into appendages of the central government. They must be allowed to generate and diversify their sources of revenue so that they can reduce their heavy dependence on the central government.

The empowerment of local authorities can be done by giving them constitutional protection. Their existence must be provided for in the constitution rather than leave them to the whims and powers of Ministers. The Ministers are in some cases, as is the case in Botswana, empowered to dissolve them as and when they deem it appropriate to do so.

c. The Use of ICT and E-governance to Deliver Services

A significant proportion of the world population is made up of people who were born in the 1990s. This generation is commonly referred to as the millennials. They were born at a time when technology was already at the centre of everything that we do in public, private or non-governmental offices. Everything that they do and need revolves around technology. Hence, it is of paramount importance that when public policies and programmes are formulated and implemented, the policy makers must be mindful of the needs, expectations and aspirations of the millennials. They can be serviced, together with other citizens, through the use of ICT and E-governance.

According to Batalli (2011:160), ICT is an important resource that can be used to renovate government and enhance the quality of services rendered to citizens. She goes further to state that it can be used to modernise the recruitment process of public servants, improve the decision making process, combat corruption, facilitate the flow and exchange of information, reduce the costs of delivering public goods and services as well as consolidating the basic principles of good governance. And since citizens can consult administrators and politicians through the internet, it reduces bureaucratic red-tape and can be used to eliminate ghost workers as has been done in Cameroon (Alberti & Bertucci, 2006:9).

In the same vein, Batalli (2011) argues that since ICT can be used for innovation and transformation of public administration, its use across the various sectors of the society and the existing levels of government must be prioritised in line with the public sector reform strategies that have been embraced. ICT puts information in the hands of citizens, thus enabling them to know and appreciate things that are done in various sectors of the economy and how they can access the services offered. Hence, citizens can use the information availed to them to hold the government accountable.

An important point raised by Batalli is that E-governance is at the heart of what she refers to as two global shifts: information revolution and governance revolution. As she puts it; “Both shifts are changing the way society works and the way that society is governed. They bring the opportunity for not just incremental but radical gains in efficiency and effectiveness” (Batalli, 2011:160). Citizens nowadays have an opportunity to interact with public administrators and political leaders
technologically because they have information at their finger-tips.

High unemployment rates across African countries is an indication that political and economic policies designed by the state to respond to inequalities and social exclusion are ineffective. The situation can also be viewed as a crisis of legitimacy. Hence, there is need to formulate relevant socio-economic and political policies that address the inequalities existing within our societies. ICT and E-governance can, therefore, be used to address the existing inequalities by availing public goods and services to all the marginalised members of the society at any time that they need them. This can be done if all government departments, ministries and public enterprises have up-to-date websites so that there are no information gaps. ICT and E-governance help to bring citizens closer to the government as well as facilitate formulation and implementation of better policies which will in the long run enhance the legitimacy of the government.

Since restructuring of public organisations calls for training, retooling and empowerment of administrators, ICT can be used to reach as many administrators as possible. Universities and other training institutions can offer online programmes that can be accessed by administrators from their homes, thus cutting the costs of travelling and being away from the offices. As observed by Alberti & Bertucci (2006:13), “Currently, distance learning offers enormous cost-effective opportunities for continuous education”.

d. Research and Formulation of Evidence-Based Policies

All public policies that are formulated and implemented with a view to addressing certain needs and demands of citizens can have a positive impact on them if they are right and relevant policies. Formulation of these policies calls for mobilisation of resources to collect and analyse data on policy issues and problems, the people who are affected, how they are affected, the options that can be explored to address the problem, the involvement of potential policy stakeholders and others. In other words, effective policy formulation and implementation must be based on or supported by data.

In view of the foregoing, ministries must therefore, have well-resourced research units that can collect and analyse data for administrators and politicians. National Statistical Bureaus and think tanks must also be strengthened so that they can provide up-to-date statistics that will guide the decision making process. The need to strengthen national and ministerial research units is captured succinctly by the European Union (2015:38) when it says that;

“Policy advisors should cast a wide net when thinking about potential sources, including: official statistics; existing studies from in-house, academia, associations, think-tanks etc.; evaluation findings; surveys, panels and other original research (if appropriate and affordable); expert inputs; and evidence from stakeholders, both interested and affected parties”.

Formulation of good and relevant policies will not on its own address issues of exclusion and marginalisation of women and other groups. There is need for proper implementation as well as constant monitoring and evaluation of such policies. Monitoring and evaluation of policies and programmes has always been neglected in most of the African countries.
thus jeopardising their chances of success. In addition to availing the much needed resources to the ministerial research units to collect and analyse data, they must also be given the responsibility of monitoring and evaluating the manner in which policies are implemented so that they can identify bottlenecks and advise in terms of what needs to be done to overcome them.

e. Change Management

The restructuring or realignment of public institutions, promoting genuine decentralisation, using ICT and E-governance to renovate public administration and deliver services to citizens, strengthening of ministerial research units and constant monitoring and evaluation of policies and administrative reform strategies, call for a paradigm shift from the traditional bureaucracy to a modern one which operates in an ever-changing environment. The adoption of new ways of conducting public business calls for proper introduction and management of change. The manner in which new interventions are introduced and managed in public organisations greatly determines the degree to which they will be effective or rejected by individuals within those organisations.

Conclusion

The ideals of good governance can be realised if public organisations change the manner in which they conduct their business. They must change their structures and move away from the traditional ones and embrace structures that can enable them to quickly adapt to the ever-changing environment as well as respond promptly to the needs and demands of more informed citizens. All citizens must be placed at the centre of the process of national development and they must be viewed as important partners and recipients of public policies and programmes. Hence, a concerted effort must be made to decentralise the decision making power and authority to local agencies so that the voice of the citizens can be heard.

The use of ICT and E-governance in service delivery in affording citizens an opportunity to participate in the policy making process cannot be overemphasised. These are avenues that can keep the government in touch with citizens at all times. However, the use of the aforementioned tools with not on their own result in efficient and effective service delivery. There is a need for strategic, ethical and transformational leadership which can be promoted through constant training of public administrators as well as strengthening of oversight institutions. All these issues require managers of public organisations to introduce and manage change cautiously, lest the new interventions fail to yield the expected positive results.
References


Chipika, J.T., & Malaba, J.A., 2013. An Assessment of How the SADC Region has Progressed in the Implementation of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and Reflections on Possible Priorities for the Post-2015 UN Development Agenda


Perspectives on Gender and Corruption in Botswana: Lessons and Implications for Anti-Corruption Policy

Abiodun Marumo Tito Omotoye

Abstract

This article explores the gendered differences of perceived and actual participation in bureaucratic corruption in Botswana. By examining Afrobarometer data and documentary analysis, the study finds that while levels of perceived corruption by men and women in public institutions were high, participation in bureaucratic corruption was considerably lower. Contrary to the notion that corruption has a greater impact on women than men, this study finds that higher levels of participation across all public service categories were reported by unemployed men having to give a gift or a favour to avoid problems with the police. The documentary analysis suggested that non-monetary forms of corruption such as ‘sextortion’ have been experienced by female students and undocumented female migrants in Botswana. Nevertheless, this form of corruption has received little policy attention, despite its potential to undermine gender equality efforts. Additionally, the study finds little correlation between higher levels of women’s representation in key decision-making positions (such as parliament and cabinet) and lower levels of corruption in Botswana. Conclusively, there is need for both the gender and anti-corruption policy framework to be synthesised in order to specifically reflect on and respond to the perceived gendered dimensions of corruption.

Key words: Botswana, Gender, Corruption, Participation, Perceptions and Public Policy

Introduction

The threat of corruption and gender inequality on development has continued to receive attention from the international development community, policy-makers, and researchers. In 2001, the World Bank suggested that “greater women’s rights and more equal participation in public life by women and men are associated with cleaner business and government, and better governance. Where the influence of women in public life is greater, the level of corruption is lower” (World Bank, 2001: 12). The central recommendation was the need for governments to increase women’s participation in the labour force and politics.

The notion that a greater presence of women in key government decision-making positions would result in lower levels of corruption and stronger governance is not farfetched. Given the behavioural and social differences between men and women, it is plausible that their attitudes towards deviant behaviour such as corruption also differ. This hypothesis has been supported by a number of studies (most notably Dollar, Fisman and Gatti, 2001; and Swamy, Knack, Lee and Azfar, 2001) and challenged by others (e.g. Sung, 2003; and Goetz, 2007; Sim, Blanes, Bockelie, Kharya, Nunes, Ortiz, Romain, Singal and Vainqueur, 2017).

1Botswana Institute for Development Policy Analysis (BIDPA) Governance and Administration Unit 134 Tshwene Drive, BIDPA House, Gaborone International Finance Park, Gaborone, Botswana Email: omotoyem@bidpa.bw
The Government of Botswana acknowledges that gender equality and development can only be achieved when gender related barriers to sustainable development are identified, prioritised and addressed (Government of Botswana, 2015). Notwithstanding progress that has been made in promoting gender equality, significant challenges continue to hinder state and non-state actors’ efforts. Given the debilitating effect of corruption on political, social and economic development, particularly in developing countries, increasing scholarly attention has focused on the impact of corruption on women’s participation and empowerment. The overarching view is that the gendered impact of corruption can be differentiated. That is, “corruption creates additional obstacles for women to access and use public goods (including basic services)” (Transparency International, 2014: 4). According to the Gender is My Agenda Campaign (GIMAC) (2018) women often carry the burden and negative impact of corrupt practices more than men. In some instances, culture has been used to justify discrimination against women and girls in Botswana (United Nations Development Programme, 2012a; Kagisano Society Women’s Shelter, 2013). Yet, neither Botswana’s National Policy on Gender and Development (2015) nor the draft National Anti-Corruption Policy are designed to be responsive to the gendered dimensions of corruption. While both policies are founded on clear objectives, they remain silent on recognising the linkages that exist between gender and corruption.

Corruption, commonly defined as the “misuse of entrusted power for private gain” (UNDP, 2008) is argued to have a negative impact on women’s empowerment and participation. As such, corruption can disproportionately affect poor women and girls, particularly in their access to essential public services, justice, and security and in their capacity to engage in public decision-making (Hossain, Musembi and Hughes, 2010). Gender, as defined by the World Bank (2001) and World Health Organisation (2011), refers to socially constructed roles and learned behaviours, and expectations associated with women and men. As with other studies that have attempted to explore the gendered dimensions of corruption, this study is exploratory rather than conclusive. Botswana also presents an interesting case study because on the one hand, it remains a benchmark for several countries around the continent due to its status as perceived to be the least corrupt country in Africa as per Transparency International’s surveys. Yet, on the other hand, it lags behind in increasing women’s representation in key government and political decision-making positions. Evidently, this phenomenon contrasts the World Bank’s (2001) recommendation that increasing women’s participation in public life reduces levels of corruption. Nevertheless, this study is limited to exploring the gendered impact of corruption by examining the attitudes of ordinary men and women towards corruption, as well as their participation in corrupt activities.

This study aims to explore and understand the gendered differences of perceived and actual participation in bureaucratic corruption in Botswana. Not only does the study of gender and corruption deepen our understanding of the problem of corruption, but it also helps in developing effective and targeted anti-corruption measures. Little research and policy attention has focused on the gendered dimensions and impact of corruption in developing countries. To date, most research on gender and corruption has largely focused on Western democracies. Therefore, a
need arises to question the applicability of these findings and explanations for gender differences in developing countries. Moreover, Justesen and Bjørnskov (2014) are of the view that little is known about how corruption affects ordinary citizens and which groups are most likely to bear the social and economic costs of corruption. The study uses the most recent round of the Afrobarometer survey data (2017) to address the following research questions: do men and women perceive and experience bureaucratic corruption differently in Botswana? What policy measures can be taken to respond to gender based corruption?

**Methodology**

Disaggregated data on gender and corruption in developing countries is scant (Nawaz, 2009; Nwafor, 2019). However, the Afrobarometer Survey provides comprehensive and comparable data across a number of indicators. Botswana’s 2017 Afrobarometer data was collected from a nationally representative, random, stratified probability sample of 1,200 adult Batswana from 22 June to 4 July 2017 (Afrobarometer, 2017). Half of the respondents were men and half were women. To determine whether there are gender differences with respect to perceived and actual experiences of corruption in Botswana, the framework of analysis focuses on the following factors: i) Perceived corruption in public, private and non-governmental sectors; ii) Levels of trust in state institutions; and iii) How often, if ever, have respondents had to pay bribes to access the following basic services in the last 12 months: education, government document, healthcare, police assistance, and avoid problem with police. Data were analysed using the Afrobarometer Online Data Analysis (ODA) tool using cross tabulations. The ODA tool provides comparative statistical data from all of Afrobarometer’s survey rounds and also collects a large set of socio-demographic indicators such as age, gender, education level, employment status, and region.

The Afrobarometer is instrumental in gauging individual level perceptions of corruption and participation in corrupt acts by asking respondents specifically about their views and attitudes towards corruption, and their direct experiences with bureaucratic or petty corruption (bribery). With the exception of hospitals and/or clinics and schools, the aforementioned services are monopolised by the state. Peiffer and Rose (2018: 20) differentiate between choice and state monopolised services by arguing that “unlike choice services, by definition services that are a state monopoly do not give people the opportunity to exit from what may be a corrupt institution.” In Botswana, the majority of hospitals and clinics, and schools are state-owned. Furthermore, state-owned services are highly subsidised and remain an attractive option for the vast majority of citizens that cannot afford private health and school services. Therefore, individual contact levels with public institutions are likely to be higher than those with private service providers. By analysing how men and women interact with these public services we can advance our understanding of the gender-corruption association in Botswana.

In addition to the analysis of Afrobarometer data, document analysis was undertaken. This included a review of both the National Policy on Gender and Development, and the draft National Anti-Corruption Policy. Oversight institution (i.e., Directorate on Corruption and Economic Crime) annual reports, Botswana’s 2014 Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women
(CEDAW) Country Report, and other relevant reports were also assessed. The review of documentation provided background information regarding the policy and social context of gender and corruption in Botswana. Bowen (2009) adds that documents provide supplementary research data, as information and insights derived from documents can be valuable additions to a knowledge base.

Gender Perspectives on Corruption in Botswana

Morris (2008: 394) argues that despite the rather extensive methodological debate and the customary acknowledgement that perception is not the same as actual behaviour, few, have sought to examine the relationship linking participation and perceptions of corruption.

In this section, we first consider the gendered perceptions of corruption in Botswana, followed by an analysis and discussion of the gendered participation levels in corrupt activities. Corruption by its nature is difficult to measure, hence, the common approach used by most studies and indices (e.g., Transparency International’s Corruption Perceptions Index) is to examine perceptions of corruption.

Perceptions of Corruption

Not only does corruption distort the allocation of resources and hamper effective service delivery, it also undermines the legitimacy and credibility of public institutions. Respondents were asked: “How many of the following people do you think are involved in corruption, or haven’t you heard enough about them to say?” The findings are presented in Figure 1.

Figure 1: Perceived corruption in the public, private and Non-Governmental Organisation sectors

Source: Afrobarometer (2017)

Both male and female respondents perceived higher levels of corruption in the public sector (both central and local government), police services and the private sector. The private sector relies extensively on government for business opportunities through various procurement and tendering opportunities, so there is a stronger likelihood that this public-private nexus would result in higher levels of perceived corruption by both men and women. However, more males than females perceived higher levels of corruption across all of the examined sectors. Possibly this is because men enjoy higher contact levels with various public institutions than women, as evidenced by more
women reporting ‘not knowing’ or hearing enough about the institution in question.

Some studies (e.g., Kubbe, 2013) have attempted to establish a link between corruption and institutional trust. That is, higher levels of perceived corruption result in lower levels of trust in institutions. To determine male and female respondents’ levels of trust in state and political institutions, participants were asked “How much do you trust each of the following, or haven’t you heard enough about them to say?”. Figure 2 indicates male and female response levels of trust in the following state institutions: parliament, local government councils, police, and courts of law.

**Figure 2: Levels of Trust in State Institutions**

[Bar chart showing levels of trust in state institutions for male and female respondents.]

**Source: Afrobarometer (2017)**

Although higher levels of perceived corruption were recorded by both men and women, particularly in local government and police services, this did not diminish the levels of trust men and women have in these institutions. Generally, women displayed higher levels of trust across all examined institutions. As noted above, a possible explanation is that fewer women, compared to men, are involved in public life. This implies that women would have a higher propensity to trust public institutions because of their infrequent contact or limited interaction with various public institutions.

In another question, respondents were asked ‘How likely is it that you could get someone to take action if you went to your anti-corruption unit or corruption prevention committee to report corrupt behaviour like misuse of funds or requests for bribes by government officers, police, or school or clinic staff?’. More women (65%) than men (62%) believed that it was somewhat or very likely that action would be taken by the anti-corruption institution.

**Participation in Corruption**

Morris (2008: 394) notes that “expressions of corruption may incorporate beliefs and attitudes only loosely related to corruption itself. As such, perceptions may reflect different normative standards of individuals. Overall, this places such responses about perception far from efforts to determine the real level of corrupt activity.” Respondents of the 2017 Afrobarometer survey were asked several questions relating to their direct experience or
participation in *quid pro quo* activities. Despite somewhat high levels of perceived corruption by men and women in corruption, Tables 1 to 5 affirm that there is a dissonance between perception and participation. A negative correlation exists between perceived levels of corruption and participation in corrupt activities in Botswana. Peiffer and Rose (2018: 24) state that the “relationship between perceptions and the payment of bribes may be endogenous – those who have paid a bribe for a public service may be more likely to perceive officials as corrupt or reciprocally a perceived high level of corruption in the public sector may encourage people to pay a bribe because it is considered the normal thing to do when dealing with public officials.”

Table 1 indicates that more men than woman had to pay a bribe in order to receive a government document (e.g. birth certificate, driver’s license, passport or permit). However, although more women than men reported having never had to pay a bribe to obtain a government document or permit, it appears that more unemployed women than unemployed men had to pay a bribe.

**Table 1: Paid bribe to obtain government document (gender and employment status)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Employment status</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>No, looking</th>
<th>Yes, part time</th>
<th>Yes, full time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender of respondent</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Never</td>
<td></td>
<td>35.5%</td>
<td>29.0%</td>
<td>38.8%</td>
<td>40.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Once or twice</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.1%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A few times</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0.8%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Often</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No contact</td>
<td></td>
<td>63.5%</td>
<td>71.0%</td>
<td>60.4%</td>
<td>56.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender of respondent</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Never</td>
<td></td>
<td>30.8%</td>
<td>38.3%</td>
<td>43.3%</td>
<td>40.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Once or twice</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.2%</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
<td>2.0%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A few times</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Often</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No contact</td>
<td></td>
<td>68.0%</td>
<td>61.0%</td>
<td>54.7%</td>
<td>59.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Respondents were asked: How often, if ever, did you have to pay a bribe, give a gift, or do a favour for a government official in order to get the document you needed?]

The issuance of government documents and permits is subjected to internal bureaucratic processes that may significantly increase the amount of time it takes before an individual is issued with the document. As such, administrative delays may contribute to incidents of bribery, as individuals seek to circumvent the process. For instance, the DCEC (2015; 2016; 2017) has persistently identified the transport sector as one of the most problematic public services as a result of corruption. Allegations of transport officials and individuals engaging in illicit conduct (e.g., sale and purchase of driver’s licenses and roadworthiness permits) are common.
Access to free basic health care is recognised as a fundamental human right, but as Table 2 reveals, slightly more men (3.1%) had to pay a bribe either once or twice, or a few times to receive medical assistance. Unsurprisingly, higher contact levels with public health services (clinics or hospitals) were reported by women, who are said to rely more on this type of service than men.

Table 2: Paid bribe to receive medical assistance (gender and employment status)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Employment status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gender of respondent - Male</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Never</td>
<td>73.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Once or twice</td>
<td>0.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A few times</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Often</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No contact</td>
<td>25.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gender of respondent - Female</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Never</td>
<td>85.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Once or twice</td>
<td>0.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A few times</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Often</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No contact</td>
<td>13.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Respondents were asked: How often, if ever, did you have to pay a bribe, give a gift, or do a favour for a health worker or clinic or hospital staff in order to get the medical care you needed?]

Despite the fact that more women rely on public health services and thus have higher contact levels, this did not result in higher incidents of bribe paying amongst women. Nevertheless, it appears that more employed men and women reported having to pay a bribe to receive medical assistance. This contradicts Hossain et al’s. (2010) finding that because poor women are the primary users of basic public services (e.g. health and education), they disproportionately pay for corruption in service delivery. Contextually, it is likely that Botswana’s ‘zero tolerance’ to corruption weakens opportunities for endemic corruption to occur, particularly for a critical service like health care. The Ministry of Health and Wellness (2013) acknowledges that several corruption risk areas are present in Botswana’s health sector. These include health personnel abusing their positions for personal gain, such as soliciting and accepting bribes or gifts from individuals in exchange for favourable treatment, and colluding with contractors to defraud government, amongst others.

Likewise, the Government of Botswana has placed access to basic primary education as an important facet of the country’s development. The country’s high literacy rates today are a reflection of the efforts of government in providing equal access to education for its citizens. However, as Table 4 indicates, bribery
is present in the education system as more women than men reported having to pay a bribe to a teacher or school official either once or twice, or a few times in order to receive a service (e.g., placement of child) from a public school. The majority of the respondents were unemployed females and reported having higher contact levels with public schools.

Table 3: Paid bribe to access school services (gender and employment status)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Employment status</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>No, looking</th>
<th>Yes, part time</th>
<th>Yes, full time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Gender of respondent- Male
| Never               |                   | 28.1%| 34.1%       | 30.7%          | 44.2%          |
| Once or twice       |                   |      | 1.2%        |                | 0.8%           |
| A few times         |                   |      |             |                |                |
| Often               |                   |      | 0.2%        |                |                |
| No contact          |                   |    71.9%| 64.4%      | 69.3%          | 55.0%          |
| Gender of respondent- Female
| Never               |                   | 36.8%| 45.1%       | 53.3%          | 43.9%          |
| Once or twice       |                   | 1.4% | 0.4%        |                |                |
| A few times         |                   | 0.7% |             |                | 0.4%           |
| Often               |                   |      |             |                |                |
| No contact          |                   | 61.0%| 54.5%       | 46.7%          | 55.7%          |

[Respondents were asked: How often, if ever, did you have to pay a bribe, give a gift, or do a favour for a teacher or school official in order to get the services you needed from the schools?]

Education is a public good and is considered by most national governments as central to the socio-economic development of a country as demonstrated by significant annual budgetary allocations towards this portfolio. The National Policy on Gender and Development (2015) identifies access to quality education, training and information as an important national development area. However, the DCEC (2015; 2016) notes that this sector, as with other public services, is not immune to fraudulent activities. As the literature suggests, it is women, rather than men, who play a primary caregiving role. The patriarchal culture found in Botswana is said to assign “different roles to women and men, leading to women being responsible for domestic affairs with limited chances to get access to education, employment and in decision making” (KSWS, 2013: 32). This would probably explain why higher contact levels with public school administrators or teachers were reported by unemployed and part-time working women. This is further supported by the fact that 72% of the unemployed male respondents indicated having no contact with a public school in the last 12 months. There is little publicly available information on the extent to which corruption affects primary and secondary public schools, but a study by Selepe et al. (2017) illustrated that sexual forms of corruption are an area of concern in the country’s education sector.
The results in Table 4 support existing studies, as well as DCEC reports, which find that the police services remain one of the most vulnerable sectors to corruption. The Botswana Police Service (BPS) has played and continues to play a significant role in maintaining law and order in Botswana. Citizens rely on the police services for a range of administrative, civil and criminal matters on a daily basis.

Table 4: Paid bribe to receive police assistance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Employment status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No, looking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender of respondent - Female</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Never</td>
<td>19.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Once or twice</td>
<td>1.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A few times</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Often</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No contact</td>
<td>78.8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Respondents were asked: how often, if ever, did you have to pay a bribe, give a gift, or do a favour for a police officer in order to get the assistance you needed?]

As Table 4 indicates, more men (14.7%) than women (7.6%) reported having to pay a bribe, give a gift or a favour to a police officer before receiving assistance. Approximately 9.3% of the males were either unemployed or working part-time, while all the female respondents were either unemployed or working part-time. This form of bribery was reported to be prevalent in cities and towns, as opposed to rural and peri/semi-urban areas. As discussed earlier, men perceived higher levels of corruption and lower levels of trust in the police services than women. Perhaps these attitudes are influenced by the fact that they are required, more often than not, to pay a bribe in order to receive police assistance.

By way of example, several challenges were highlighted by the Kagisano Society Women’s Shelter Baseline Assessment Report on Gender Based Violence (GBV) in villages and districts of Botswana (Sebina, Ghanzi, Kasane and Ramotswa) regarding the police service’s ability to address issues of GBV. The non-governmental organisation (NGO) notes that “police are slow to react to cases of gender based violence and at times they dismiss them” (KSWS, 2013: 26). The study’s participants, specifically male survivors of GBV, were suspicious about the capacity of the police to resolve their cases. Furthermore, some men were concerned about being ‘re-abused or mocked by the police’ for reporting cases
of GBV. It is possible that in some instances, individuals may have to pay a bribe or offer a gift to a police officer in exchange for the officer to prioritise a certain matter. Arguably, police officers wield a certain amount of discretionary power, which might hinder effective and accountable service delivery. This is further illustrated in Table 5. Respondents were asked to indicate how often, if ever, did they have to pay a bribe, give a gift or do a favour for a police officer in order to avoid a problem at checkpoints, during identity checks, or traffic stops, or during an investigation.

Table 5: Paid bribe to avoid problem with police

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Employment status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender of respondent -</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Never</td>
<td>37.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Once or twice</td>
<td>0.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A few times</td>
<td>3.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Often</td>
<td>0.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No contact</td>
<td>57.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender of respondent -</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Never</td>
<td>34.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Once or twice</td>
<td>1.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A few times</td>
<td>1.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Often</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No contact</td>
<td>62.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Respondents were asked: how often, if ever, did you have to pay a bribe, give a gift, or do a favour for a police officer in order to avoid a problem with the police?

Approximately 20% of the male respondents reported having to pay a bribe to a police officer in order to avoid a problem. In contrast, 6% of the female respondents indicated paying a bribe. Of the 20% male respondents, 8.8% were unemployed and 7.6% were employed on a part-time basis. On the other hand, of the 6% female respondents, 3.1% were unemployed and 2.2% were employed on a part-time basis. The police are entrusted with the responsibility of safeguarding the integrity of the public service, as well as acting in the best interests of society. However, as Tables 4 and 5 indicate, corruption in the police service was reported by respondents as the most prevalent area of concern in terms of the public service.

Kaunda (2008: 127) is of the view that the “working environment, remuneration and conditions of service for public servants are not very attractive. There is a considerable turnover of staff. There has been an exodus of nurses and police officers who left the service because they felt the public service was unrewarding.” Consequently, institutions like the Botswana Police Service have focused on improving their workforce through the continuous provision of staff training and
development opportunities, welfare and social support services, as well as recognising and rewarding employees individually and collectively. However, the effectiveness of these strategies in improving reducing maleficent behaviour is questionable.

In contrast to, and affirmation of, existing literature on gender and corruption, it appears that more men than women reported having had to pay a bribe in order to receive assistance or access a public service. With the exception of access to public school services, men indicated having to pay a bribe to access each of the examined public services. In some instances, we observe that unemployed men and women are impacted more by incidents of bribery than men and women who work on a full-time basis. This corroborates Justesen and Bjørnskov’s (2014) argument that poor people are more likely to be victims of corrupt behaviour by street-level bureaucrats as the poor often rely heavily on services provided by government. Although the government of Botswana has made significant progress in reducing poverty levels, women continue to represent a high portion of the nation’s poor (CEDAW, 2014). In this study, women reported higher contact levels with public schools, hospitals and clinics. More unemployed women reported having had to pay a bribe to receive a service at a school, but more men reported having to do so before receiving medical assistance or treatment. Higher gender differences were experienced in the police services, with more unemployed men indicating that they had to bribe a police officer to either receive assistance or avoid a problem (e.g., traffic fine). Batswana’s levels of actual participation in corrupt activities can be described as what Meng and Friday (2014) term sporadic and/or incidental corruption.

Meng and Friday (2014) differentiate individual-sporadic corruption from systemic corruption because of the variation in the extent to which individuals (victims) are expected to participate in corrupt activities by all agencies or services, or whether they are victimised by selective entities. The fact that most respondents reported ‘never’ having to pay a bribe to access or receive a service is a positive reflection on the anti-corruption culture that is embedded not only in Botswana’s public service, but also in the traditional fibre of society. Corruption “is not yet a way of life” (Sebudubudu, 2003: 126).

Given that corruption poses challenges to achieving gender equality across a spectrum of developmental issues, this paper has attempted to explore the linkages between gender and corruption in Botswana. The National Policy on Gender and Development acknowledges gender mainstreaming across all sectors as important to addressing gender related barriers, but as this section has discussed, there are gender differences in the manner in which men and women experience corruption in Botswana. Little policy and research attention has been given to this cross-cutting and emerging issue, particularly as government and civil society remain concerned about high levels of gender based violence in the country.

Earlier studies by Dollar et al. (2001) and Swamy et al. (2001) argued for increased representation of women in government as an anti-corruption strategy. However, this view may be oversimplified at best or inapplicable to certain developing countries, as demonstrated in Table 6. The liberal democratic perspective contends that there is no causal relationship between gender and corruption. Rather, it is the presence of modern liberal democratic institutions that contribute to the control
of corruption in countries like Botswana. However, “women’s participation in political and public life shows stagnated and slow growth, and in other instances a decline” (CEDAW, 2014: 24). Nevertheless, lower participation of women in political and public life does not seem to have affected Botswana’s overall levels of governance, as suggested by indices such as the World Governance Index (WGI) and the Ibrahim Index of African Governance (IIAG).

Table 6: Women’s Representation in Government and Corruption

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>% women in cabinet</th>
<th>% women in parliament</th>
<th>2017 Transparency International CPI Score (Out of 100)</th>
<th>% participation in corruption (2017 Afrobarometer)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rwanda</td>
<td>47.4</td>
<td>61.3</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>No data available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>41.7</td>
<td>42.0</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>No data available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>36.7</td>
<td>34.3</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>12.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zambia</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>18.0</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>3.87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seychelles</td>
<td>30.8</td>
<td>21.2</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>No data available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Swaziland</td>
<td>26.3</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>4.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mali</td>
<td>24.2</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Namibia</td>
<td>24.0</td>
<td>41.3</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>22.7</td>
<td>19.4</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>14.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>22.2</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>6.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Togo</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>17.6</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>6.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tanzania</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>36.4</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>3.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lesotho</td>
<td>18.2</td>
<td>25.0</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>No data available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gabon</td>
<td>17.9</td>
<td>17.1</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>8.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghana</td>
<td>17.4</td>
<td>12.7</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zimbabwe</td>
<td>16.1</td>
<td>32.6</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>5.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Botswana</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benin</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>6.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>12.0</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>12.65</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: UN Women (2017) and author’s reconfiguration

Of the listed countries in Table 7, only Rwanda (55), Seychelles (60), Namibia (51) and Botswana (61) scored over 50% on Transparency International’s 2017 CPI, a widely used measure of perceived corruption. Despite Botswana’s status as the least corrupt African country, it has achieved this with considerably lower levels of women occupying key decision-making positions in cabinet and parliament. On the contrary, countries with higher female representation in key decision-making positions, like Uganda and Kenya, reported higher participation levels in corrupt activity, at 13.2% and 14.9% respectively. This suggests that while increasing female representation in key decision-making positions is important for strengthening governance and women’s empowerment, it remains less likely that it would result in a direct reduction in actual or perceived
corruption. Gender mainstreaming has become an important facet of development, particularly in reducing inequalities between men and women. However, as noted by Sim et al. (2017), the argument that integrating women as part of a country’s anti-corruption strategy, not only risks endangering the gender equality agenda by reinforcing stereotypes, but may also mask governance challenges.

Considerations for Anti-Corruption Policy

Botswana is yet to adopt a national anti-corruption policy. A draft policy was developed in 2014, but several amendments would have to be made to reflect the evolving anti-corruption landscape in Botswana. However, anti-corruption policies and codes of conduct have been adopted by some government ministries (e.g., Ministries of Health and Wellness, Local Government and Rural Development, and Infrastructure and Housing Development). Given the multi-faceted nature of corruption, and in particular, the impact it has on men and women, it is paramount that policymakers and anti-corruption agencies adopt anti-corruption strategies that specifically pay attention to the linkages between gender and corruption. This implies that the National Policy on Gender and Development must specifically include corruption as a key priority area and ensure that the Directorate on Corruption and Economic Crime is integrated in the institutional framework of the policy (i.e., National Gender Commission and the Advisory Committee). The unequal social and economic costs imposed by corruption necessitate the inclusion of an institution that can adequately contribute to the implementation efforts of the NPGAD.

The World Bank (2001: 33) notes that “despite the greater prominence of gender issues in the development debate, the importance of bringing a gender perspective to policy analysis and design is still not widely recognised, nor have the lessons for development been fully integrated by policymakers.” In terms of perceived corruption, gaps were reported in how men and women perceive corruption in government (both local and central), police, and the private sector. On average, more men than women perceived higher levels of corruption in each of these institutions. The reverse was true when respondents were asked about levels of trust in state institutions. Women indicated higher levels of trust in institutions like Parliament, Councils, and the Police. Conversely, levels of actual participation in corrupt activities were lower, but contrary to other studies, more men than women indicated having to pay a bribe to access a public service.

Although it may appear that more men are affected by incidents of bribery, several studies and local media reports have found that women are impacted by non-monetary forms of corruption. Perhaps, a limitation of the Afrobarometer survey is the difficulty it poses for the researcher to interpret the specific favours being referred to because corrupt exchanges may take non-monetary forms. Sceptics may argue that “the data is blind with respect to the prevalence of other practices of which women are more likely to be the victims of, such as sexual extortion” (Boehm and Sierra, 2015: 9). It is possible that unemployed men and women who reported having to pay a bribe, give a gift or favour to a public officer were subjected to sexual, as opposed to, traditional forms of corruption. The NPGAD makes reference to the fact that sexual harassment perpetuates discrimination and impedes gender equality efforts, but there is a
need to expand the scope of sexual violence to include exploitation and sextortion. Arguably, the implication is that this form of corruption violates human rights and, therefore, requires a significantly different response or sanction.

The UNDP (2012b) recommends that anti-corruption laws such as the Corruption and Economic Crime Act recognise and seek to mitigate physical abuse, sexual exploitation, and other forms of corruption specific to women’s experiences. Sim et al. (2017) reiterate this point by suggesting that anti-corruption policies must identify and condemn ‘non-traditional’ types of corruption that have a greater impact on women, such as sextortion. Hossain et al. (2010:12) add that “despite its disproportionate effect on women, corruption involving sexual exploitation or extortion generally escapes measurement in standard corruption analyses and sexual exploitation or extortion is less likely to be reported than other forms of corruption.” In fact, the 2012 Gender Based Violence study found that only one in ten female rape victims had reported the incident to the police. 23% of the women interviewed reported experiencing sexual harassment at work, school, public transport or at a traditional healer. However, they chose not to report these incidents.

Reasons for not reporting abuse are varied (see World Health Organisation, 2004; Seloiwe and Thupayagale-Tshwenegae, 2009; IAWJ, 2012). This coincides with the finding that very few female respondents (27%) of the 2017 Afrobarometer believed that ordinary people could report incidents of corruption without fear, whereas 70% indicated that people risked retaliation if they reported. Slightly more men (30%) believed that ordinary people could report incidents of corruption without fear, while 67% said there was a risk of retaliation.

To alleviate citizens’ fears of whistleblowing, the Government of Botswana enacted the Whistleblowing Act in 2016, but it is less clear what efforts have been made to sensitize citizens, and in particular, gender advocacy groups (e.g., Emang Basadi) on its provisions on protected disclosures. Interestingly, Section 8(d) of the Whistleblowing Act empowers the Botswana Police Service to receive disclosures of impropriety, yet the BPS was perceived by both men and women as one of the most corrupt public institutions. Furthermore, more unemployed males reported either having to pay a bribe to receive police assistance or avoid a problem with the police. Therefore, it is important to question whether or not, for instance, a victim of police corruption would be willing to report the offending officer to their employer. Kaufmann et al. (2008) are of the view that an official will be more likely to be reported for abuse if the agency where she/he works has well-defined and effective mechanisms that citizens can ‘voice’ their suggestions and complaints.

Undoubtedly, the establishment of the Internal Affairs Unit (IAU) in 2009 is commendable. The Unit is tasked with promoting ethical standards for police officers, and investigating allegations of corruption and indiscipline within the Botswana Police Service. However, there have been growing calls about the need for the establishment of an independent police authority or commission (see Sunday Standard, 2013 and Mmegi, 2016). This is further necessitated by the fact that despite the formation of the IAU, the Ombudsman, for instance, reported receiving more complaints about the police service than any other public institution between 2014 and 2017. It may be that complainants lack trust and confidence in the IAU to handle certain cases because of a perceived lack of independence. Furthermore,
such an independent police authority or commission would be empowered to enforce punitive measures against police officers that violate ethical standards, similar to the Independent Office for Police Conduct in England and Wales, and the Independent Police Investigative Directorate in South Africa.

Numerous Civil Society Organisations (CSOs) representing gender interests exist, but given the capacity challenges facing most NGOs and CSOs in the country, their capacity to strengthen current anti-corruption efforts may be inadequate. Both the draft Anti-Corruption Policy and National Policy on Gender and Development allocate several responsibilities to CSOs, but their ability to perform these responsibilities will require ministerial departments like the Department of Gender Affairs to provide the requisite support, particularly at a grassroots level. The UNDP (2012b) proposes that to ensure that programming and policies are relevant and effective for poor communities and women especially, grassroots women should be involved at all stages of anti-corruption interventions, including design, implementation, and evaluation. The gender-corruption intersection in Botswana suffers from a lack of gender disaggregated data, thus creating gaps in highlighting the gendered impact of corruption in service delivery. However, given the findings of this study, there is a need to ensure the involvement of women at a grassroots level in the design of anti-corruption interventions.

Contrary to other studies that found a correlation between increased female participation in public and political life would result in a decrease in corruption; for this study, we find that higher female representation in key decision-making positions does not necessarily reduce levels of corruption, as illustrated by Botswana’s governance indicators on female representation in cabinet and parliament vis-à-vis levels of perceived corruption and individual participation in bureaucratic corruption. Therefore, increasing female representation in key decision-making positions should not be specifically undertaken as an anti-corruption strategy, but rather as a measure of addressing underlying governance issues. As noted by Alatas et al. (2009: 663) “gender differences reported in previous studies may not be as universal as stated, and may be more culture specific.” Further research is required to explore and understand these gender differences.

Conclusion

The discourse on the relationship between gender and corruption has gradually evolved towards an understanding of the gendered impact of corruption. The objective of this study was to contribute to that debate by exploring the relationship between corruption and gender in Botswana. To understand this relationship, the study examined men and women’s perceptions of corruption and their participation in bureaucratic corruption (bribery). The findings revealed that more men than women reported higher levels of perceived corruption in the public and private sectors, but more women than men showed higher levels of trust in state and political institutions.

Literature suggests that a possible explanation for this variation is that women’s lower contact levels with public service institutions, results in lower levels of perceived corruption in these institutions. The findings of this study support this notion, as shown by reported levels of participation in corruption. More men than women reported having to pay a bribe or give
a favour to access at least each of the examined public services, with more male individuals doing so to either avoid a problem with the police or receive police assistance. Women reported higher levels of ‘never’ having to pay a bribe or give a favour in order to access a public service or receive assistance. A similar finding was reported by Peiffer and Rose (2014) on the role of gender in bribe paying in Africa. However, it remains important that anti-corruption policies are designed to address non-traditional forms of corruption, such as sextortion. Notwithstanding the scant data available, discussions revealed incidents of sextortion in Botswana, and it was found that this form of corruption affects women as opposed to men. Yet, this specific form of corruption has not received adequate policy attention. Thus, institutions and departments such as the Directorate on Corruption and Economic Crime, and Department of Gender Affairs should collect sex disaggregated data on corruption. Effective policy responses rely on the availability of comprehensive and reliable data.

The fact that Botswana’s levels of perceived and/or actual corruption can be described as sporadic or incidental, as opposed to systemic, does not mitigate the threat it poses to institutions like the Botswana Police Service and other state agencies. Transparency and accountability in the police services may be enhanced by establishing an independent police authority or commission to ensure that levels of public trust and confidence are not compromised as a result of high levels of perceived and actual participation in illicit behaviour in an integral institution like the BPS.

Indeed, men and women in Botswana experience corruption differently. Additionally, sextortion, as a specific form of corruption, escapes policy attention. It is also important to understand how economic factors such as unemployment influence the manner in which women and men respond to, and are affected by corruption. Therefore, the design or redesign of new or existing anti-corruption and gender policies should take these gendered differences into consideration. Gender-based policy analysis is critical to assessing and understanding the differential impact of proposed and/or existing policies on women and men. This approach challenges the assumption that men and women are affected by policies in the same way.

References


Gender is My Agenda Campaign (GIMAC), 2018. Draft Concept Note. 31st Civil Society Pre-Summit Consultative Meeting on Gender Mainstreaming in the African Union and Member States.


Meng, Q., and Friday, P., 2014. Historical Overview of Corruption and China’s Responses, 1978 to


Imperatives: The Five P’s: People, Planet, Prosperity, Peace and Partnerships and Sustainable Development Goals - The Need to Transform Public Administration and Management

D. Mpabanga¹ and L. Sesa²

Abstract

The objective of this paper is to explore Sustainable Development Goals (SGDs) in relation to the five P’s, which constitutes People, Planet, Prosperity, Peace and Partnerships and assess how these SDGs could be used to transform public administration and management in Africa. In addition, the paper evaluates the extent to which the five Ps can promote the Africa Agenda for 2063. This paper equally focuses on the concepts of innovation, resourcefulness, integration as well as inclusivity and the attempts made to link these concepts to SDGs for 2030 and realization of the Africa agenda for 2063. The SDGs is thus discussed in conjunction with the Africa 2063 Agenda with regard to transformation of public administration and management in Africa. The discussion centers around five Ps which are derived from the sustainable development goals that pledge to have made progress by 2030. The Africa Agenda for 2063 also aims for inclusive and equal societies of which is the (thrust) of the SGDs agenda for 2030. This paper reviews the SDGs for 2030 and the Africa agenda for 2063 and assesses how the two could be applied to transform public administration and management in Africa through innovation, integration, and inclusiveness.

Key Words: Innovation, Integration, Partnerships, Transformation, Public administration and Management.

Introduction

It is important to highlight that Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) have been developed to continue where Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) expired in 2015 hence are a replacement and continuation of MDG’s (United Nations, 2015). According to United Nations (2016) SDGs focus on sustainable development in the seventeen goals set by the UN. In order to achieve the SDGs by 2030, the UN emphasizes the need to transform public administration and management in terms of leadership and supporting institutions with a view to promote creativity and innovation. The breadth of the 2030 Agenda for sustainable development suggests that the SDGs cannot be realized by government on their own (United Nations, 2015). This requires the forging of strategic partnerships between government, private sector, civil society, academia, media and development partners (bilateral and multilateral). The UN further asserts that Global agenda for 2030 and the African Union (AU) Agenda for 2063 call for the strengthening of public administration institutions and increase in

¹Department of Political and Administrative Studies: University of Botswana
²Department of Political and Administrative Studies: University of Botswana
democratic values for the achievement of enhanced and effective service delivery and transparency. It is imperative to point out that SDG’s and the AU Agenda for 2063 call for emphasis on socio-economic development and prosperity that includes all segments of the society. Therefore emphasis and focus on the five P’s should be based on inclusivity, resourcefulness, innovation and wellbeing for all as well as the successful implementation of SDG’s and the AU Agenda 2063 aspirations.

SDGS for People, Planet, Prosperity, Peace and Partnerships: The Imperatives: Five Ps

The five imperatives were derived from scrutinizing the SDGs and pairing or categorizing the seventeen goals according to people; planet, prosperity, peace and partnerships. The discussion focuses on the role of SDG’s agenda for 2030 and the extent to which these goals can be used to help strengthen public institutions in Africa and facilitate delivery of public service through innovativeness, resourcefulness and inclusivity of all segments of the society. The discussion will commence with the first imperative for people, second for planet, third for prosperity, fourth for peace and the last imperative for partnerships. The analysis will include the outlining of achievements and challenges faced in an attempt to transform Africa’s public administration and management in their efforts to successfully implement the SDGs through innovation, resourcefulness and inclusiveness and ensuring that no one is left behind (United Nations, 2015).

a. The People

The first imperative for people is a combination of seven SDGs comprising goals 1-7. The SDG’s that speak to people are the goals concerned with ending poverty (SDG 1) in all its forms everywhere, ending hunger (SDG 2), good health and wellbeing, quality education (SDG 4), gender equality (SDG 5), clean water and sanitation (SDG 6) as well as affordable and clean energy (SDG 7) (United Nations, 2015). These seven SDG’s are core as they focus on people, for example, achievement of SDGs and Africa Agenda for 2063 will not be possible if people remain poor, hungry, do not have access to quality education, clean water, sanitation as well as affordable and clean energy. The wellbeing of all segments of the society is dictated by having food and water in order to survive and at the same time having access to quality education to take advantage of economic opportunities available in the country. To ensure environmental sustainability in terms of water security, air quality and ecosystem services, the key levers under our control are the portion of food grain we produce for consumption, the rate of expansion of the livestock sector, the share of coal-fired power in our energy mix, the use of fuel-wood, and the rate of expansion of mining industries including coal (United Nations, 2015).

The objectives of the SDG’s for people are to facilitate and provide a template for governments to come up with innovative and resourceful ways of making this happen in terms of ending hunger, providing health services, gender equality as well as affordable clean water and energy (United Nations, 2015). These goals could be achieved through transformation of public administration and management and by making public institutions...
and leadership responsive and ensure that services are provided in a transparent and participative manner. The SDG’s and Africa Agenda 2063 calls for moving away from public administration and management that focuses on designing policies and programmes on behalf of societies, but instead focus on strengthening institutions and empower all segments of the society to ensure they are part and parcel of the developmental agenda for 2030 and 2063.

b. The Planet

The second imperative of the planet is a combination of four SDGs entailing 11, 13, 14 and 15. According to the SDG 11 (United Nations, 2015) cities are a focal point of ideas, commerce, culture, science, productivity and social development, hence the imperative to use natural resource and culture to advance socially and economically. This SDG calls for efficient and sustainable urban planning and natural resource management. As cities are hubs of innovation and ideas, where creativity is at its peak emanating from a diverse population growth from rural-urban migration, African countries should take advantage of this innovation and creativity to convert these into tangible projects in various industry sectors with a view to creating jobs and economic opportunities for all. In the process of creating above, it is mandatory that issues of, for example, congestion, air pollution, waste management, housing, safety and transport are addressed. These could be managed by adopting appropriate city planning and management strategies that infuse sustainable development goal (SDG 11), for example; the use of renewable energy, reducing air pollution by governing the number and type of cars in cities, waste management which is coupled with recycling strategies at household and community level through encouraging separation of plastic, glass and other wastes degrading the environment at collection stage.

One of the major pollutants to the environment are plastic waste and most African cities do not have strategies to manage cities in an environmentally safe manner, and the end result is pollution of cities and animals feed on plastic material, thus affecting the quality of the carcass in beef or meat production. Inability to manage plastic and other waste would affect city dwellers in terms of air pollution leading to unsafe air, increase energy consumption due to high and unplanned rural urban migration which would put pressure on public health, due to the increased demand for transport, waste disposal (sewage), energy consumption and ultimately affecting the health of the city dwellers (United Nations, 2015).

One of the suggestions by the United Nations for sustaining the planet is the use of diverse city population to create jobs, come up with innovative and sustainable ways to manage cities (2015). This could be done by involving all in the communities, university scholars as well as encourage university faculty to engage in research that explores the creativity and innovativeness that promotes inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable natural resource management and cities with opportunities for all.

As pointed out by United Nations (2015) sustainable consumption and production is an essential element in enhancing better quality of life for all. United Nations further acknowledges that currently there has been an increase in global consumption of natural resources, especially in Eastern Africa. Thus, the need to promote sustainability in resource
and energy efficiency for example by reducing natural resource use, paying attention to degradation and pollution of the environment. The focus therefore should be on supply chain in all production and consumption, where an effort should be made by governments, educational sectors, NGO’s, communities and households to educate rural and city dwellers to adjust their lifestyle that promotes efficient and sustainable resource and energy consumption or use.

The private sector that transacts business with government should not be left out in practicing sustainable consumption and production. Through the public procurement and tendering processes they are required to propose and infuse sustainability in their services or project proposals to government. For example, by promoting the use of energy efficient processes in housing and road construction, recommending recycling of waste if it is a waste collection and management tender, and hence promote sustainable cities and productive patterns.

Also is the issue of climate change that is a major threat facing the world today as pointed out by United Nations (2015). Climate change is global issue as it has devastating effect on the economy, lives and it can be costly. Changing weather patterns are widest world over as sea levels are changing, weather patterns are becoming extreme every year and greenhouse emissions are on the rise (United Nations, 2015). The sad part is that most affected by the changes are the poorest of the world (ibid).

Various agreements have been ratified and signed at a summit attended by global leaders to address climate changes, such as Conference of Parties (21) in Paris (United Nations, 2015). However, extreme climate change and weather patterns continue to affect countries as United Nations (2015) stated, the greenhouse emissions have increased by 50 % since 1990, oceans have warmed up, and temperatures have increased, therefore there is urgent need to implement strategies for cleaner and resilient climate management by changing lifestyles starting from household level by using Information Communication Technology (ICT) to change behaviours to combat climate change.

The second imperative which focuses on the planet forms the 4th SDG that concerns itself with life below water (United Nations, 2015). Conservation and sustainable use of world oceans, seas and marine resources could be attained through sustainable management of forests, oceans, and coasts by halting loss through biodiversity. Climate change is affecting anything below water as such world temperatures in oceans and seas are increasing and there are increasing cases of over fishing, hence affecting population of fish. There is an increasing incidence of pollution in the oceans and seas by clinical waste and plastic waste. Even the quality of world oceans is deteriorating due to pollution.

There is an absolute and immediate need for conservation to promote the sustainable use of natural resources like fish below water. United Nations (2015) points out that oceans absorb about 30 % of pollution produced by humans and as such practicing conservation on sea and land would prolong resources underwater for future generations. Life on land matters as it is the key ingredient to support human life. The goal of SDG concerning the planet is to promote sustainable management of forests, combat deforestation, halt and reverse land degradation and stop bio diversity in its tracks (United Nations, 2015). This SDG
could be achieved through protection of land, forests, and strengthening natural resource management. The effect of poor conservation of land leads to an increased loss of forests through for example, farming, use of land for land development into rural or urban housing, road construction, industry production and wood collecting or cutting for household or industry use and human – wildlife competition or conflict in land use.

The above practices if not managed sustainably and conserved appropriately would lead to deforestation, loss of bio diversity, desertification, and in the long run affect the lives of people who depend on these. As pointed out by United Nations (2015) desertification has affected 74 % of the poor due to land degradation, increasing incidences of poaching and wildlife trafficking. Overharvesting of medicinal plants has affected rural traditional medicine plant base hence the need to conserve and sustainably manage life on land by practicing sustainable climate change and conservation.

This could be achieved by involving all in innovation and creating ideas on how to best manage and sustain life on land. Some of these include: Sourcing ideas from diverse urban population; infusing sustainable and conservation practices in the education sector from primary to tertiary education curricula as in environmental sciences; infusing SGD 15 in national, urban and rural development plans and support university research funding to focus in this area. Other aspects pointed out in United Nations (2007) academic institutions and business sector need to collaborate in order to help advance SDGs through the principles of responsible management education (PRME). PRME emphasis transformation of businesses and management education, research and leadership, for example by promoting SDGs awareness, developing responsible leaders and recruiting talent with a sustainability mindset United Nations, 2007). Also is the element of engaging and training public officers on effective implementing, monitoring and evaluation of SDGs, especially regarding life on land and under water as these are the most neglected SDG goals by governments and people globally; having public policies and programmes targeting all SDGs would help implement SDGs and involving all to come up with innovative and creative ideas on sustainable lifestyles at household and organizational level would help improve quality of life for all on the planet and minimise the chances of having to look for three more planets to accommodate humans, fisheries and animals as the earth would be un-inhabitable due to environmental damage, increased population and climate change by 2050 (United Nations, 2015).

c. Prosperity for All

The third imperative is prosperity for all and is a composition of SDGs 8, 9, 10 and 12. According to United Nations (2015) global poverty continues to increase despite growth in annual GDP, furthermore global unemployment continues to increase at 5.7 % and the working poor are increasing globally. This brings the importance of SDG 8 which calls for the promotion of inclusive and sustainable growth, with a focus on creating decent employment and economic opportunities for all (United Nations, 2015). The creation of employment and economic opportunities requires innovative ways to create jobs as well as countries creating positive environment that encourages starting and sustaining business, and promoting foreign direct investment. As pointed out by the United Nations, current
growth patterns are not providing enough decent work, especially for young people who lack adequate skills and training, leading to widespread unemployment, while women continue to be economically undervalued and excluded in many countries and regions. Most of the developing countries particularly in Africa have an investment environment which discourages doing business, as supporting legislative and institutions are weak. Lack of investment and under consumption affects economic growth as well as low labour productivity due to poor working conditions and lack of infrastructural development to support and sustain investment (ibid).

The above factors have hence affected prosperity for all as lack of economic opportunities translate to lack of source of income to enhance quality of life and standard of living. To achieve economic growth and attract foreign direct investment and at the same time attain inclusive and sustainable opportunities requires starting by creating a positive environment for example by enhancing legislative framework for doing business and strengthening supporting institutions to sustain growth. Furthermore, stimulating the economy through inclusive policies and programmes that support multi-sector industries and non-traditional industries such as recycling of plastics and glass, sports, entertainment and performing arts, Information Communication Technology, enhanced agricultural by products, and using sustainable energy and climate management mechanisms, for example, using solar power and preserve rainwater (United Nations, 2016).

Prosperity for all could be achieved by involving all in the society and improving access to finance. This includes innovativeness and creativity in helping the creation of and sustaining wealth as well as to sustain equal access to quality education from primary to tertiary education. Improving working conditions especially in Sub Saharan Africa would motivate all segments of the society to prosper in terms of earning a living wage and improve the standard of living. As pointed out by United Nations (2007) corporate sustainability commences with operations that meet human rights, environment and anti-corruption. Hence the United Nations developed the ten principles of global compact which are aimed at establishing a culture of integrity, where companies’ responsibility includes the sustainability of the planet and its people. In addition to attaining prosperity for all, investing in infrastructure would stimulate economic growth. As articulated by United Nations (2015) building resilient infrastructure, sustainable industries and fostering innovation is mandatory. Therefore, the need to build sustainable and innovative air, sea, road, irrigation and infrastructure that support investment, growth, and would increase job opportunities.

United Nations (2015) purports that investing in ICT is the key element to industrialization and development, and this is linked to investment in human capital development to help innovations and creativity in ideas of using high technological products and services and extending these innovations to Small and Medium Enterprises as they form the backbone of Africa’s industrial sector. For example, encouraging financing and coming up with innovative ways to do business, and providing services through mobile technology as SME’s make over 90 % of business and create 50 to 60 % of jobs globally (United Nations, 2015).
Prosperity would be attained when efforts are made by governments to reduce inequality within and among countries (United Nations, 2015). Lifting people out of poverty means investing in social services and infrastructure so that all in the society (including the disadvantaged and marginalised) will have access to health, education, economic opportunities, land, and finance in order to create employment opportunities for themselves. As indicated by United Nations (2015) economic growth will not reduce poverty if it is not inclusive, accessible and sustainable at economic, social and environmental levels.

Reducing inequality within and among countries means reducing tariffs worldwide for imports exports and trade, particularly for Least Developed Countries (United Nations, 2015). Inclusive and sustainability in the reduction of inequality also means improving social protection globally, especially to the disadvantaged such as the children, disabled and old. The greatest inequality to be reduced is income inequality among and within countries, as there exists 30 % of unequal income within households and between men and women (United Nations, 2015).

Prosperity is also linked to sustainable consumption and production patterns (United Nations, 2015). Prosperity can thus be sustained by promoting the efficient use of resources and energy, providing green and decent jobs, providing access to basic services to all (United Nations, 2015). This goal relates to SGD12, which calls for “Do better with less” and these should be integrated into national and local development plans, policies and programs. If implemented successfully, the achievement of SDG12 would reduce future economic, environmental and social costs (United Nations, 2015). According to the United Nations (2015) promoting sustainable production and consumption would reduce resource use, degradation and pollution hence will improve quality of life for all.

d. Peace

According to the United Nations (2015) promoting peace, justice and strong institutions would lead to peaceful and inclusive societies. Furthermore, world peace is currently threatened by increasing wars, homicide, human trafficking and violence against women and children (ibid). In this case there is need for governments especially in developing countries to create and strengthen justice and peace institutions and legislative framework. Creating peaceful and inclusive societies means providing access to justice for all (United Nations, 2015). Furthermore, peace and justice mean curbing corruption, having protection of human rights and having supportive institutions that promote the rule of law. It is vital to enhance global cooperation though the UN Security Council and other relevant UN institutions as it is necessary to prevent the spread of wars and extreme violence as is now afflicting many countries.

e. Partnerships

The effective implementation and successful achievement of the imperatives for people, planet, prosperity and peace requires collaboration at local, national, regional, continental and international level. As emphasized by United Nations (2015) the successful achievement of sustainable development goals is using partnerships between governments, civil society and the private sector and inclusiveness of these partnerships are built on values and a shared vision of goals that put people and planet
at the centre. Therefore the fifth imperative regarding partnerships would enhance the transformation of public administration and management in Africa as it calls for valuable partnerships to be established and fully utilised to share best practice experiences in transformational leadership, innovations, resourcefulness and inclusivity in public policy formulation and program delivery for the benefits of all.

Partnerships in SDGs perspective refers to sharing of innovations in creating opportunities for all in the society, sharing discoveries in science and technology as opposed to competing, as it would transform societies and improve livelihood for all. Forging of partnerships and sharing would also transform leadership in government and the private sector in terms of collaborations and networking innovative ways to design and deliver quality policies and programs that protect and sustain people and the planet (United Nations, 2016).

In the case of developing countries in Africa such as Botswana, the guiding principle of public investment is to convert wealth into productive asserts that have the greatest potential to support economic growth and job creation (Botswana National Strategy Office, 2015). The priority of public investment is human capital, including education, vocational and technical training, and broader national human resources management, with a special focus on improvement of quality and outcomes. The second priority is to upgrade the physical infrastructure and connectivity of the country to fill infrastructure gaps that present binding constraints to faster growth of the priority clusters, with careful prioritization and sequencing to maximize immediate impact on growth (Botswana National Strategy Office, 2015:34).

In this case, foreign direct investment can be used as the promoter of partnerships as international or multinational companies need to form authentic partnerships with governments and civil society to, for example, engage in industry that promote energy efficient processes and sustainable use of natural resources to protect the planet, help create markets for agricultural products and assist SME’s in the process. Promote sustainable production and consumption by encouraging recycling, and apply the “Do more and better with little that is available” concept development by United Nations (2015). As specified by United Nations (2015) it is important that no one is left behind in the attainment of SDGs, and it is the responsibility of leadership in public and private sector to implement the five imperatives for people, planet, prosperity, peace and partnerships through the national and local development plans.

An Assessment of Progress Towards the Attainment of the Five Imperatives: People; Planet; Prosperity; Peace and Partnerships: The Case of Botswana

Botswana is among the 193 United Nations Member States that endorsed the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. Since the implementation of the 2030 Agenda and the 17 SDGs commenced on 1 January 2016, the Government of Botswana has demonstrated strong political will and commitment to implement them through the country’s Vision 2036, the Eleventh National Development Plan (NDP11), the Eighth District Development Plans (DDP8) and the Fourth Urban Development Plans (UDP4), as well as the Draft National Framework for Sustainable Development (NFSD) (Botswana Government, 2018). The latter framework
provides a strong basis for Botswana to successfully implement the global development agenda (United Nations, 2018:06).

a) In Botswana, the government has developed social benefit policies and programs to alleviate hunger and poverty through various programs such as food baskets for the poor, marginalized segments of the society, including people living with disabilities, and provides a small pension to sustain the older cohort of the population (Botswana Government 2018). However, the country needs to enhance the existing programs and come up with people-centered innovative and creative ways of ending hunger, reduction of child mortality, poverty, enhancing access to quality education, promote good health and wellbeing. In addition, innovative ways of ensuring access to clean water and sanitation and to have all segments of the society use affordable and clean energy should be the focus of government in partnership with the private sector as the strategies of the last forty to fifty years are not effective anymore. Innovative ways of ending hunger and poverty could be achieved by building and sharing prosperity through inclusive social and economic transformation of existing poverty eradication programs and taking the five imperatives into the planning and implementation process in Botswana and the African continent at large.

b) Prosperity, Innovativeness and Resourcefulness in Promoting Inclusive Economic Growth: (to end poverty) For example, Botswana achieves this through offering pension funds and disabled people stipends (SDG 1). Inclusive economic growth translates to government and the private sector working together to create sustainable jobs and at the same time equality should be promoted so that no one is left out in benefitting from economic opportunities. In addition, innovative ways are needed to create social protection systems to help those left behind in the economic development process. Creativity in economic development and inclusiveness means assisting those affected by natural disasters, elderly women, orphans and the disabled as well. Poverty reduction is placed centrally in Botswana’s overall development agenda. Botswana’s new Policy Framework for poverty eradication aims to completely eradicate income poverty line of $1.25/day (purchase power parity), Food Poverty Line and the Poverty Datum Line (Poverty Eradication in Botswana: 2015:19-20).

Grow, Share and Consume Food: (for Zero Hunger, SDG 2)

Coming up with innovative ways to grow and share food to provide support system through finance, marketing, sustainability (storage) can be achieved through Research and Development (R&D) in the agricultural sector and support accorded to universities in this field of study. This shall support communities through, for example, in Botswana; school feed program from Agricultural produce yielded in the country. Agriculture is a top priority of water user and to achieve water security, a strategic shift is needed towards water demand management that both avoids future water shortages and keeps water affordable.

c) Transformational to Ensure Food Security (SDG 2)

Innovative ways of food security through growing and sharing needs to be promoted as opposed to old ways of poor food production. For example, the government of Botswana only provides farming subsidies like seeds, fertilizers and cover costs for ploughing to only those who apply the modern row planting agricultural technique, as opposed
to the olden broadcasting method which was used before and was prone to low yields. SDG’s call for transformational approach in developing and implementing policies and programs that promote taking care of the natural environmental like soils, oceans, fossils and biodiversity and use the natural process of growing food (SDG 3), to ensure healthy lives and promote wellbeing for all ages.

d) Educate and Involve all Segments of the Society: (SDG 3) aims to ensure healthy lives and promote wellbeing for all ages, on health, HIV/AIDS, wellness in order to save lives at individual, household, community or local and national level. At local level in Botswana, schools and the kgotla (customary court) system could be used to spread the messages while social media can be used to compel the message to the whole nation. The SDG on Gender equality (SDG 5) emphasizes inclusion of all in improving the wellbeing of all by increasing equal access to education, health, decent work, political representation and economic decision making.

e) As pointed out by the UN (2016) quality education is a fundamental ingredient to grease the wheels of sustainable development and improving quality of life, therefore countries should aim to ensure access to quality education (SDG 4). Quality education helps people in communities to acquire knowledge and come up with innovative ways to solve societal problems. Sustainability will be achieved as creativity and innovativeness springs from diverse sectors of the population as they are accorded access to quality education, as compared to the MDGs, which focused on universal access to education.

Access to quality education to all emphasizes inclusiveness to all, including women, girls, and minorities, disadvantaged and indigenous people of all nations globally. At the same time quality education means all people having education from primary to tertiary level, including a positive education environment in which schools have facilities like ICT, water, electricity and teachers are adequately trained and scholarships are made available to children from poor or disadvantaged backgrounds. Quality education also means that students should be able to be fluent in Mathematics, reading and writing.

f) Ensure Access to Water and Sanitation for All (SDG 6)

Access to clean water and sanitation are one of the major contributors to the wellbeing and healthy nations. As pointed out in United Nations (2016), lack of access to water, poor sanitation and hygiene impact negatively on food security, livelihood choices and educational opportunities. Governments around the globe therefore need to invest in infrastructure to ensure that all people have access to clean water and sanitation. Governments also need to come up with innovative and resourceful ways to provide those facilities through education.

g) Ensure Access to Affordable, Reliable and Sustainable Energy.

As pointed out in United Nations (2016) access to affordable energy is a fundamental element of life and is major global challenge. Affordable energy is required for job creation; combat climate change, enhance food production and consumption and at the same time increase income for all, for example in Kenya there is a small scale project producing biogas from animal dung for cooking and in Botswana a project is underway testing the use of biogas produced from an indigenous plant to fuel cars at the University of Botswana under the
faculty of engineering and technology. The United Nations emphasizes that the key to universal access to affordable and efficient, renewable energy is for governments to commit in coming up with and supporting innovative and creative ways, for all to have access to clean fuel and use of renewable energy in households, buildings, transport and industry such as water, solar, wind power and bio gas. This can be achieved by making equal access to quality education for all so that diverse ideas and creativity can be tapped from society as they are the ones affected the most by climate change, exposed to pollution and are the best to come up with simple and sustainable solutions to improve access to affordable energy.

Summary

The above mentioned was a narration of the five imperatives entailing people, planet, prosperity, peace and partnerships deduced from SDGs as a means to successful implementation through resourcefulness, innovation, inclusiveness and sustainability. The assessment suggests the need for transformational leadership, which should be inclusive of the youth who will come up with creative ideas on how to achieve SDGs and the AU Agenda 2063. As pointed out by United Nations (2015), the youth are critical thinkers, change makers and innovative. Therefore, it is imperative that governments, private sector and the community engage them for innovativeness and creativity in organisation leadership transformation nationally and globally. As alluded by (United Nations, 2016), 90 % of youth live in developing countries, so it will be advantageous to fully utilize their innovation and creativity in driving SDGs and Africa Agenda 2063. The Youth form an important segment of the society in terms of driving social change, inspiring political change and driving the implementation and achievement of SDGs by 2030 and Africa Agenda by 2063. Involving and engaging the younger generation will therefore help achieve these goals and prevent the slow pace and business as usual approach accorded to MDGs in the past.

The whole point of SDGs is to create sustainable job opportunities, share innovation, increase foreign domestic index, free trade, and use of ICT to enhance policy and program delivery in the public sector. Furthermore sharing of ideas to transform the public sector leadership globally and at the end attain peace and prosperity for all segments of the society.

Lessons for the Achievement of the Five Imperatives

a) The major issue of concern is whether African countries can transform their public administration and management through the SDG’s on the basis of the five imperatives focusing on people, the planet, prosperity, peace and through partnerships. The biggest challenge being human resources and human capital which is never adequate to effectively transform the continent’s administrative and management structures and systems through resourcefulness and innovativeness.

b) The second challenge in African countries regarding the application of SDGs to transform public administration and management, using the inclusive approach to public policy design and implementation is to reduce the number of people left behind in the achievement of SDGs and the AU agenda for 2063. The
rural poor are left behind in particular as they are faced with increasing pressure in terms of natural resource usage, management and depletion forcing to migrate to urban areas.

c) Thirdly, Policy makers in African countries should be flexible enough to allow those who are left behind such the youth, women, marginalized to participate in the design of policy and programs that would assist them and address their concerns in the five imperatives. This approach will give this segment of the population an opportunity to design policies and programs that will effectively uplift their lives.

d) Fourthly all African countries should prioritize the implementation of SDGs according to the five imperatives, focus on one imperative at a time per year, provide an monitoring and evaluation template for each imperative, monitor, evaluate and at regular intervals report on the successful implementation of each imperative. Sharing the success stories of achievement will motivate and help other countries strive to uplift the lives of all in their respective countries. Following this agenda would minimize and avoid the mistakes made from the MDGs where countries especially in the African continent moved from one goal to the next without having M&E system to evaluate achievements. The mistakes of MDGs should not be repeated.

e) African governments, international institutions and organizations responsible for the implementation of SDGs and the five imperatives should encourage the application or use of the learning organization approach or model (Armstrong, 2009; Carbery and Cross, 2013). The learning organization model emphasize that an organization must learn from its mistakes and strive to perform better next time by not repeating the same mistake and avoid following and using the same process or system that failed previously.

f) SDGs should be imbedded in clear M&E system, including explicit channels of accountability, where each SDG and imperative is monitored until achieved/full implemented. There is need for regular forums (bi-annually) to report on the M&E for SDGs, Africa agenda and five imperatives. The M&E system should include an assistance mechanism for countries that are lagging behind in implementation and a sanctioning tool included for countries that fail to implement the five imperatives.

g) One of the biggest challenges in developing countries in Africa is leadership that is based on affiliation as opposed to merit. Appointment of people in leadership and senior management positions is clouded with favouritism and political rewards which is not based on merit. A culture of corruption and nepotism in appointments needs to be addressed in order to transform public administration and management in Africa.

h) Senior government officials should be encouraged to attend the M&E forums and take the responsibility and accountability of the successful implementation and achievements of the five imperatives. Equally important is to design motivational tools for officers who
are in direct contact with ordinary citizens and reward these officers according to the Public Service Motivation (PSM) perspective which suggest that some people are intrinsically motivated by performing meaningful public service tasks (Cunningham, 2016).

i) For the five imperatives to be successfully implemented there is need to design and establish strong legislation and institutions to support SDGs and the five imperatives. The judiciary and the supporting instruments should be strengthened in order to support fair and equitable access to justice delivery. The judiciary should be strong enough to adequately deal with injustices particularly the wrongs against the marginalized. These institutions should be strengthened in order to promote peace and justice across all segments of the society to ensure no one is left behind. Some countries in Southern Africa such as Botswana, Mauritius and South Africa have performed well in this area and others could learn from them (Global Competitive Report (2015-2016).

j) Lessons can be learnt from other African countries in terms of the transformation of public administration and management such as Ghana (Haruna, 2003), where the public service has been transformed to enhance program and service delivery.

k) Finally, it is imperative that African countries share achievements and share success stories regarding implementation of SDGs, research findings, innovations and inventions in the areas of people, planet, prosperity, peace and partnerships. The above lessons would help facilitate the achievements of SDGs and the AU agenda 2063 focusing on the five imperatives of people, planet, prosperity, peace and partnership using the innovative, resourcefulness and inclusive approach to development that ensures that no one is left behind.

Conclusion

SDGs are very important in enhancing quality of life for all in the society. They focus on resourcefulness, innovation, inclusiveness and sustainability. As governments make decisions in relation to implementation of SDGs, plans at national and local levels should be designed to incorporate SDGs and the AU 2063. The old ways of including 5Ps in development plans without commitment in implementation, monitoring and evaluation of outcomes and impact should be left in the past. The future calls for the 5 Ps to form part of the implementation and monitoring plan. The fight against poverty has been on Africa’s agenda for more than five decades as this formed part of national development agenda since most countries gained independence. However, very little has been achieved in eliminating poverty in the last fifty years.

The aspiration to achieving peace, access to justice and equality has been on the agenda for too long, SGDs call for the need to conserve, protect and sustain the planet. Prosperity dictates for decent jobs, which are sustainable, and a positive investment climate to sustain foreign direct investment and jobs. Finally authentic and sustainable partnerships are the new way of uplifting societies out of poverty and enhancing the quality of life. Partnerships under SDGs and the AU dictate that all segments of the society should be involved in being resourceful and innovative in
helping curb poverty, create safe environment in cities, help create sustainable and decent jobs as well help communities have equal access to social services in the areas of quality education, health, safe water and sanitation to help communities live a better life. Bottom-up planning dictates sourcing of diverse ideas, stimulating innovation from diverse urban populations, educating communities on conserving the planet, water, sustainable usage of renewable energy and change their lifestyles to waste management including re-cycling of waste to minimize damage to the land and seas.

The business as usual approach to SDGs and Africa agenda will lead to lip-service to the achievement of five Ps as which was the case with casual approach to the implementation of MDGs. Hence the need for resourcefulness, innovativeness and inclusive approach to reaching SDGs in order to enhance people’s life on the planet, eliminate poverty, hunger and human misery by strengthening institutions and establishing genuine partnerships that would enhance quality of life for all and sustaining these for generations to come.

References


Assembly G. G. (1948) Universal declaration of human rights. UN General Assembly


United Nations (2016) Progress towards the SDGs: Report for the Secretary General

United Nations (2007) UN Global Compact Goals

Female Leadership and Key Decision Making in The Roman Catholic Church: Is There Hope at the End of the Tunnel?

Chikerema A.F.¹, Sithole A². and Colonel. S. Chikwavira³

Abstract

This research reveals that the Roman Catholic Church has an organizational culture that differs from that of other churches. In some aspects the church’s organizational culture revolves around the principles and values of a Patriarchal Society based on its traditional biblical belief, with men holding all the leadership posts and the women involved in administrative roles. The Church appears to lack institutional mechanisms such as gender units to monitor implementation of gender initiatives. A qualitative research design was employed. Document analysis, in-depth interviews and focus group discussions were administered on ordained priests, brothers and sisters who had been purposively selected. The findings reveal that the Church appears not to accept women’s ordination into priesthood and makes strong biblical references to support its religious beliefs and practices. The Church should formulate a Gender Policy which will guide various issues within the church. Catholic leadership should demonstrate the will to institute changes in the Church.

Key Words: Catholicism, Gender Mainstreaming, Decision Making and Leadership

Introduction

Gender roles in the Roman Catholic Church have been a subject of intrigue and controversy. Critics say teachings by St Paul, the Fathers of the church and scholastic theologians perpetuated the notion that female inferiority was divinely ordained. Some official teachings consider women and men to be equal, yet different, therefore complimentary. The complimentary position is seen to uphold what has been the most traditional teaching on gender roles in the church.

Catholicism is a Judeo-Christian religious tradition which, originated from Jesus Christ. The supreme authority of the Church is known as the Holy See which is the central government of the Church. The Holy See is an institution headed by the Pope which under international law and in practice has a legal personality that allows it to enter into treaties as the juridical equal of a State. According to Patterson and Paetro (2016) it has permanent observer status in the United Nations supported by Permanent Missions in New York and Geneva; it has a level of influence on the world stage because its delegations and missions to the United Nations have the right to speak, make alliances, lobby, except to vote, (Patterson and Paetro, 2016). At the landmark conferences in the 1990s such as the Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing and the International Conference on Population and Development in Cairo the members of the Holy See fought against proposed new approaches to women’s rights

¹Lecturer, Midlands State University, Department of Politics and Public Management Department
²Lecturer, Midlands State University, Local Governance Studies Department
³Member, Zimbabwe Defence Forces
including the idea that women have identifiable rights (Patterson and Paetro, 2016).

The Church is engaged in secondary and higher education, missionary hospitals, social centers and craft centers in different parts of the world. Apart from the male dominance in ordination into priesthood, in all these other activities women can make decisions only up to a certain level. Although the Church is particularly active in promoting civil rights and political participation through the Catholic Commission of Justice and Peace, the role of women in leadership still has to be addressed as male dominance within the church is very evident. Despite other churches now having female Bishops such as the Anglican Communion - Elizabeth “Libby” Lane, the United Methodist Church- Marjorie Matthews, (Spencer, 2013), the Lutheran Church - Elizabeth Eaton, (Strybis, 2015). The Church has allowed only one woman, a Silesian nun to reach the position of a junior minister.

March (1999) asserted that by making gender mainstreaming the responsibility for all, it makes it to become the responsibility of no one. While gender mainstreaming should be the responsibility of all, ultimate responsibility for ensuring related policies should be rested upon an accountable unit which in this case is the Holy See. It is important to understand the relationship between gender and religion, the importance of women’s role in the church and how they were perceived in the early church. Daly (1964) states that there have been a number of significant sociological contributions to the study of religion and gender in recent decades, which have nevertheless failed to make a significant impact upon the wider field of gender studies.

Gender Mainstreaming and the Church

Gender mainstreaming is defined as a strategy towards realization of gender equality. It involves the integration of a gender perspective into the preparation, design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of policies, regulatory measures and programmes with a view to promoting equality between men and women, (European Institute for Gender Equality, 2016). Gender mainstreaming eliminates inequalities between men and women. Once gender mainstreaming is in place, formulation of policies is done in a way that redresses inequalities between men and women. In the 1970s there was an observation that women were being excluded from development programmes. According to Muyoyeta (2004) the Women In Development (WID) approach then advocated for the inclusion of women in all planning and in development programmes. This would ultimately improve women’s situation in society because their subordination originated from their exclusion and limited access to resources as well as control of resources.

The gender mainstreaming strategy was established for the advancement of gender equality during the Platform for Action at the Fourth World Conference on Women held in Beijing, China in 1995. Since the Beijing Conference, gender mainstreaming has gained momentum, particularly at the higher levels of national and international policy making. While the objective of the Beijing Platform for Action was clear, there are problems with the use of the term gender mainstreaming. There is a widespread tendency in gender studies to associate gender mainstreaming with women. For some people, gender is merely another way
to say women. Thus in program design, gender mainstreaming would mean adding an activity for women to a project and in the evaluation stage counting the number of women who have benefited. Most international and regional protocols such as those by United Nations Development Programme; European Union and the Southern African Development Community on gender do recognize that gender mainstreaming is about gender relations and analyzing gender roles and responsibilities, which are determined by social and cultural factors and are therefore changeable.

Global and National Policies on Mainstreaming Gender

The United Nations System has six principal organs, one of which is the Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC). ECOSOC was established in 1948, by the United Nations Charter. ECOSOC (2001), reveals that, the gender mainstreaming policy permeates from the 1948 UN Charter (of which the Church is a permanent observer). This Charter calls for the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and it is from this framework that, the Platform for Action which is an agenda for the empowerment of women came into being. ECOSOC (2001), affirms that, in September 2000, the UN entrenched the Platform for Action by drawing up the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) whose third goal was the promotion of gender equality and empowerment of women by 2015. The MDGs have since been replaced by the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). SDG Number 5 is on achievement of gender equality and empowerment of women and girls. This includes elimination of discrimination against women and girls, eliminating violence and harmful practices, promoting economic empowerment and financing, ensuring participation and leadership in decision making and ensuring healthy lifes, (Wahlén, 2017).

At the UN, ECOSOC created its own Platform for Action in 2001, which called upon regional groupings, governments and organizations to follow the path of gender mainstreaming. Since then, continental and regional groupings as well as nations have domesticated the conventions on gender mainstreaming. As a follow up to this, many Church organisations are guided by the Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW, 1979) which is the key agreement on women’s human rights.

According to Muchinguri (2008), the Government of Zimbabwe developed and adopted its first National Gender Policy in 2000. It had the overall goal of mainstreaming gender into the national development process. The policy was guided by amongst others, the international human rights instruments such as the CEDAW, Beijing Platform for Action and Millennium Development Goals. Regionally, it was guided by the AU Protocol on Women’s Rights (GoZ, 2012) and the SADC Declaration on Gender and Development (GoZ, 2012). The policy at national level can now be aligned to Section 23(a) (1) of the Constitution of Zimbabwe which prohibits discrimination on the basis of gender (GoZ, 2012).

Reasons for Exclusion of Women In Leadership

The major reason why women are treated differently from men when it comes to leadership is based on the Church’s traditional biblical belief. According to Stewart (2014), it is the Church’s longstanding belief that
women should not be admitted to priesthood because Christ did not choose any women to be among his twelve disciples. Pope John Paul II (1994) in his Apostolic letter to the Bishops of the Church in 1994, (Skladanowski, 2016), said that women cannot be ordained into priesthood because of the following: the example recorded of Christ choosing His apostles only from among men. The constant practice of the Church, which has imitated Christ in choosing only men and the living teaching authority which has consistently held that the exclusion of women from priesthood is in accordance with God’s plan for His church. Traditionally the Church taught that women were not created with the same degree of perfection as men, unable to reason as well or reflect God as fully. While this conception of women as explicitly laid out by St Thomas Aquinas, (George, 1999; Wijngaards, 2000) is no longer taught, many modern Catholics believe that the Church’s current teachings remain informed by it.

Stewart (2014) argues that women’s exclusion from priesthood was for a long time, a barrier to the diaconate as well since deacons were merely priests in training. With Vatican 11’s restoration of a diaconate that does not lead to priesthood, women’s ability to fulfil this role has become more of an open question. According to Zagano (2003), Pope Paul VI (1963-1978) requested a study on women deacons but the document remains unpublished. The church has not definitively stated that women will never be restored to the diaconate; a role that was open to them in New Testament times and for many centuries thereafter, but such restoration does not appear to be on the immediate horizon. Factors impeding the issue of gender mainstreaming are summarized when one analyses the Church’s anthropology, its natural law and Catholic ethical teaching, the person of Jesus and the early church and what Mary symbolized in the Christian world. However, at this stage it is important to note that in 2016, Pope Francis, the current Pope, announced during a meeting with heads of women’s religious orders from around the world that he would create a commission to look into the possibility of allowing women to serve in the Church as deacons, (Wooden,2016).

In addition to this, the Pontiff said that women could have greater decision making power in the Church’s hierarchy (Ball, 2014). This would surely mark an end to the Church’s practice of an all male clergy. When Pope Francis assumed office he talked about his vision for the Church: a Church that was less clerical, and had a stronger lay involvement and a greater presence of women (Harris, 2016). However, Pope Francis said that the reform would not be a quick process (Harris, 2016).

**Women in Key Positions within the Church**

In contrast to the examples of other churches’ doctrines as given above and despite Benedict’s pledge, the Church still has had and has employed women or allowed few women in key positions. Hermine Speier (1898-1989) was the first woman to be properly employed by the Vatican to put the photographic archives of the Church’s museums in order. It can be applauded that the number of women working in the Vatican has doubled from 11 percent in 1978 to 21 percent in 2007. In 2004, 195 women were employed by the Vatican and in 2014 a total of 371 women were reported to be working at the Vatican City, (Mintz, 2015). However, the numbers of women employed in offices in the Holy
See are said by, Mintz (2015), to have just increased by one percent from 17% in 2010 to 18% in 2014. Most women are in support staff positions and have little input in decision making, a pattern replicated in archdioceses and dioceses globally. The two top positions in every Vatican agency must be held by the ordained that must be male.

It is, interesting to note that in the United States there is a nun by the name Sister Donna Markham who will be the first ever female president of Catholic Charities. During the reign of Pope John Paul II (1978-2005), the first woman (or non-ordained person to be appointed to a superior ranking position in a top level Vatican office) was a Salesian Sister. Sister Enrica Rosanna (under Secretary of a Vatican congregation/the Congregation for Institutes of Consecrated Life and Societies of Apostolic Life, from 2004 until she retired in 2011). Sister Rosanna was the first non-ordained person, to have authority (in almost 2000 years) over the ordained as the priests reported to her. It must be noted that though she was given authority her post did not approach the highest positions in the inner workings of the Church, (Sapien, 2014; Salt and Light Catholic Media Foundation, 2016; Harris, 2016). The second woman to be in a similar position is Flamina Giovanelli the under Secretary for council for Justice and Peace. Mary Ann Glandon was appointed head of the Pontifical Academy for Social Sciences, Letizia Pani Ermini head of the Roman Pontifical Academy of Archaeology in 2003 and Garcia Ovejera (the first woman and laywoman to be appointed the Vice Director of the Holy See Press Office, (Salt and Light Catholic Media Foundation, 2016), (Harris, 2016).

In September 2014 the Pope appointed four women to the International Theological Commission. Women now comprise 16% of the Commission’s members. Some churches that have grudgingly admitted women to positions of power have acknowledged that they function better with women in top posts. It has to be pointed out here that McElwee (2016) makes reference to women serving as deacons in the early centuries of the Church. He makes reference to Phoebe who is mentioned by the Apostle Paul in his letter to the Romans (Miller, 2011). If women in the Church had been represented among the echelons of responsibility, it is likely that many decisions that are currently coming to light would not have been made. The sexual abuse that is alleged to have transpired, would probably not have taken part.

Methodology

The research employed a qualitative research design to explore how the church subordinates’ women to second class status in the Church. The researchers chose a qualitative approach because it gives a detailed and in-depth analysis of the subject as a result of the close interaction. Wilson, Esiri and Onwubere (2008, p.10) observe that qualitative research involves collection of extensive narrative data in order to gain insight into the phenomena of interest.

In-depth interviews with key informants and focus group discussions were used to collect information from the ordained priests who constitute the clergy (10) and the laity consisting of brothers (10) and sisters (10) who were purposively selected since they are the ones who understand the Catholic organizational culture. Focus group discussions were used on the laity who were grouped according to their guilds of Anne’s, Mary, Monica and Joseph. The targeted population was from the Harare...
diocese which is geographically spacious and composed of 10 deaneries. This was done to solicit more information on the attitude, behaviour and views of the guilds. Document analysis was conducted in order to compliment the information obtained from the informants.

Results and Discussion

The sisters argued that the church does not promote the full humanity of women, this conforms to findings by Stewart (2014), who says that it is the Church’s longstanding belief that women should not be admitted to the priesthood because Christ did not choose any women to be among his disciples.

a) Respondents including the ordained agreed that, the clergy and the laity men are influential in decision making in the Church and society. Women play peripheral roles of a woman as wife and mother or nun.

b) The respondents were asked about the current Pope saying he would create a commission to look into the possibility of allowing women to serve in the Church as deacons. This was received with mixed reactions as they said that the Pope was now going against existing policies. The other respondents however said that they would welcome this move as it would show that the Church is abiding by the dictates of the various laws on gender mainstreaming.

c) The female informants agreed that, the church leadership do not have the will and commitment to see changes and increase the percentage of women into leadership. This is in line with Zagano (2003) who said that Pope Paul VI (1963-1978) requested a study on women deacons but the document remains unpublished.

d) The female informants talked about the cases of child sexual abuse by the clergy. They argued that such revelations would have come to light much earlier if the Church had more women in decision making posts especially the clergy.

e) Ordained sisters lauded the Church for enabling them to be in positions of authority and leadership in running institutions where they make decisions, most of these institutions have been administered to the admiration of many stakeholders. The coming on board of Pope Francis has re-ignited women’s expectations of gender equity and equality since then he is showing signs of upholding gender mainstreaming. The priests agreed that the women had done well in leading these institutions but they pointed out that the Church has fostered development in many countries globally so they did not envisage a situation where this would change if women were incorporated into leadership positions at the Holy See.

f) The research showed that most women are in support staff position and have little input in decision making, a pattern replicated in archdioceses and dioceses globally. Top positions in every Vatican Agency are held by ordained male priests.

Conclusion

From the above discussion one may conclude that the Church does not have a written policy specifically addressing the issues of gender equality. Unlike in other churches, in
In the contemporary world there are inadequate signs or will by the leadership to have women into leadership positions within the church. Though Pope John Paul II and Pope Francis made efforts to change the situation that women find themselves in within the Church. Other Churches that once only grudgingly admitted women to positions of power have acknowledged that they function better with women in top posts. If women in the Church had been represented among the echelons of responsibility at the Holy See and in the Vatican, it is likely that the 50/50 Gender Parity would have been achieved. Factors that are hindering the successful adoption of gender mainstreaming in the Church include the patriarchal society, lack of top management support, fear of the unknown and lack of will power by most of the Catholic women to stand for their rights as a result of the Church teachings and biblical beliefs.

**Recommendations**

The Catholic leadership in the Vatican should demonstrate the political will to institute changes in the Church by increasing the percentage target of women into leadership positions by also ordaining them just like their male counterparts. It is acknowledged that there are women leading Catholic institutions but the Church can go a step further by incorporating them into priesthood. The Church should establish strategies to improve gender mainstreaming in the Church and these should be implemented from multi-faceted dimensions. There is need to increase the numbers of females in the decision making positions to address cases of sexual misdemeanours. The following are required within the Church: a gender policy, a gender desk, gender champion and gender focal person that way issues pertaining to gender mainstreaming will be addressed. This will ensure monitoring of all activities within the church. The study commissioned by Pope Paul VI to determine whether women could be treated equally and serve in the diaconate should be published and its recommendations implemented.

**References**


Spencer IV, L.G. (2013) Speaking through the stained glass ceiling: women bishops’ rhetorical construction of church leadership. A dissertation submitted to the Graduate Faculty of the University of Georgia in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree Doctor of Philosophy, Athens Georgia.


The Theory and Practice of Local Governments’ Monitoring Role in Implementing Decentralisation: The Case of Uganda

Stephen Gunura Bwengye

Abstract

In Uganda, like in many other countries implementing decentralisation policy reforms, Local Governments (LGs) have been assigned an important monitoring role to ensure efficient and effective implementation. This article, based on a study for a doctorate, examines the extent to which LGs have executed their monitoring role. The study employed a qualitative approach, a case study research design, an interpretivist paradigm and an exploratory conceptual model. The methods of data collection included individual interviews, focus group discussion, document analysis and direct observation. Qualitative data were supplemented by elements of quantitative data. Analysis and interpretation of findings were done using inductive approaches. The article brings out the theoretical and practical perspectives of the LGs’ monitoring role. It is demonstrated that theoretically, the LGs’ monitoring role sounds impressive. LGs are meant to design an efficient and effective monitoring system; and prepare and implement effective monitoring plans. In practice however, this article provides evidence to show that; the efficiency and effectiveness of LGs’ efforts have largely been limited. The existing monitoring system and monitoring planning have been characterised by an inefficient and an ineffective monitoring data management system; and poorly designed and ineffectively implemented monitoring plans. It is argued that government will have to undertake practical efforts to address these weaknesses if LGs are to successfully execute their monitoring role and ensure effective implementation of the decentralisation policy.

Key Words: Monitoring, Implementation, Decentralisation, Local Governments and Policy

Introduction

In Uganda, the decentralisation policy framework, in line with devolution of power as the guiding principle for decentralisation, assigns Local Governments (LGs) an important monitoring role in the implementation of decentralisation policy. Under the Local Government Act as amended in 2008, Sections 13, 17, 24, 26, 30, 64 and 65, LGs are mandated to monitor the implementation of decentralisation programmes initiated by LGs themselves, the central government and non-governmental organisations to ensure that the programmes are efficiently and effectively implemented. In this article, the LGs’ efforts to execute their monitoring role are investigated. Theoretically, in the execution of their monitoring role, LGs are supposed to design an effective monitoring system; and prepare and implement effective monitoring plans. The focus of the article in regard to the design of an
effective monitoring system is on the existing
data management mechanisms in terms of
structures for data collection; organs for
data analysis; and information dissemination
mechanisms. For monitoring of planning, the
focus is on the identification of project areas
to be monitored, selection of performance
indicators, definition of data collection
methods, reporting and feedback mechanisms
as well as the allocation of required resources.

Designing of a Monitoring System

Local governments under decentralisation
are meant to design a strong monitoring
system to ensure effective decentralisation
implementation. A monitoring system as a
network of units and planning mechanisms
addresses a number of data management issues
such as: the tools that will be used for the data
collection; when and which organs will collect
the data; organs responsible for data analysis
and dissemination (Bhuyan et.al. 2010:9;
Kusek & Rist 2004:23; Hutchinson La Fond
2004:21).

Data Management Mechanisms

Management of monitoring data has
particularly been a critical issue in monitoring
systems. The greatest failure of monitoring
systems is in managing data. It is common
to find long-serving projects that have no
monitoring standard methods for periodically
summarising information which makes it
impossible to provide required information
on monitoring (United Nations Children
Fund (UNICEF) 2009:2; International Union
for Conservation of Nature (IUCN) 2004:8).
In the management of monitoring data, LGs
are expected to design an effective internal
data management system with structures for
data collection, analysis and dissemination of
findings to the different stakeholders. Such a
system should also address issues such as data
collection tools; and how effectively the data
will be stored (IUCN 2004:8-9; World Bank
2004; 5).

Organs for Collection of Monitoring Data

Establishing strong organs for collection of
monitoring data is a critical issue in building
a sound monitoring system. Monitoring data
collection organs need to be staffed with
technically skilled personnel. For effective
execution of their role, it is important to
ensure that the organs are given specific terms
of reference and the necessary resources.
This also helps to ensure the necessary
data quality that determines the usefulness
of the monitoring results (United Nations
Development Programme (UNDP) 2009:91;
Kusek and Rist 2008:105; Family Health
International (FHI) 2004:9). The study
established that there are various organs that
are involved in collecting monitoring data in
local governments in Uganda. All 18 (100%)
LG political office bearers and all 37(100%)
LG officials interviewed, identified such
organs as joint teams, sectoral teams, technical
monitoring teams and Project Management
Committees (PMCs). The joint teams comprise
political executive members, councillors
and technocrats from sectoral departments.
Sectoral teams are constituted by sectoral
departmental staff. PMCs consist of members
appointed from the project beneficiaries.

The joint monitoring teams carry out quarterly
monitoring activities. These teams have made
considerable contributions in providing
information that has been used to improve
project implementation. All 18 (100%) LG political office bearers and all 37 (100%) LG officials interviewed, variously acknowledged that joint monitoring teams had helped to bring out particular anomalies in project implementation but were faced with a number of challenges that limit their effectiveness. These, according to the respondents, range from limited competence on the part of politicians to grasp technical project issues to politicians adopting a fault finding approach rather than providing direction on how to improve the implementation process.

It was further noted that the monitoring activities carried out by the joint teams are not comprehensive. The activities do not cover all the projects being implemented and even for those which are covered; little attention is given to the various aspects of the projects. Overwhelming majorities (17 of 18 [94%]) of LG political office bearers and (35 of 37[95%]) LG officials interviewed, revealed that the joint teams ‘activities are narrow in coverage and that this was because of the limited number of days allocated to field monitoring visits. The findings suggest that the teams have not been able to establish the exact outputs, outcomes and impact of projects which in turn has had negative implications on the effectiveness of LGs’ performance of their monitoring role.

As regards sectoral teams, the research established that the teams have made efforts to provide monitoring data on specific sectors especially where their activities have been regular. However, the teams, in addition to facing similar problems of competence, politicians perceived fault finding attitudes; lack of comprehensiveness experienced by the joint monitoring teams; and lack an integrative approach to monitoring. All (6 of 6 [100%]) Higher Local Governments (HLGs) sectoral political heads and an overwhelming majority (12 of 13 [93%]) of heads of department interviewed, indicated that the teams involved in monitoring activities rarely share their findings with teams from other sectors. These findings imply that there is lack of an integrative approach to address issues identified by the organs in their findings as there is no sharing of experience by the various sectoral teams

PMCs have been useful in providing data on the status of project implementation. However, the committees are overwhelmed by work and yet they are not technically competent to execute their responsibilities. An overwhelming majority (17 of 18 [94%]) of Lower Local Government (LLG) officials interviewed, indicated that the PMCs were expected to carry out monitoring activities and report on progress, but the execution of such assignment required the capacity that the PMCs did not possess. With the PMCs lacking the capacity to carry out their responsibilities, it appears that they have not been effective in executing their monitoring function.

**Tools Used to Collect Monitoring Data**

Data collection tools are very crucial in monitoring data management. The tools need to be standard and be as simple and as clear as possible to enable the collection of only the data that is necessary and will be used. Such tools also need to be properly understood by the officials using them (FHI 2004:6-7; World Bank 2004:5). The findings revealed that there are no standard monitoring tools to use for data collection. Monitors use note books to record data. All (18 of 18[100%]) LG political office bearers and an overwhelming majority (35 of 37 [95%] ) of LG officials interviewed, indicated that lack of a standard
monitoring data collection tool was causing problems especially with regard to the specific data the monitors should collect. The findings suggest that due to lack of a comprehensive data collection tool, LGs have not been able to ascertain the progress on the various projects through monitoring indicators. This has negative implications on LGs efforts to establish the results and impact of the decentralisation programmes.

Organ for Analysis of Monitoring Data

Analysing data is a crucial step in a monitoring process as it determines what findings should be reported to whom and in what format. The analysis helps to compare programme targets with the actual programme performance to determine the impact of the programme (Kusek and Rist 2008:105; FHI 2004:12). The study found that there are no specific organs responsible for carrying out data analysis. The majority (14 of 19 [76%]) of district LG officials interviewed, revealed that, due to lack of organs for analysis of monitoring data, LGs could not establish the exact impact of decentralisation projects. Without data analysis, as the findings reveal, it implies that LGs cannot establish the project outputs, outcomes, impacts and the lessons learnt as well as the trends and overall levels of project implementation performance in the LGs.

Dissemination of Monitoring Findings

Once monitoring reports are completed, the next step is the dissemination of the findings. The essence of disseminating findings is to enable policy makers and implementers to assess interim achievements and make decisions for the necessary adjustments to improve programme outcomes (Bhuyan et.al. 2010:9; Gawler 2005:39; Hutchinson La Fond 2004:58-59). The findings can be disseminated in multiple ways such as meetings, detailed reports, media and workshops. Muller et al. (2008:173) in a study on a tobacco-control evaluation found that the use of multiple ways was the most effective in disseminating results. The findings on monitoring decentralisation programmes in LGs revealed that notwithstanding numerous weaknesses, some deliberate efforts have been made to disseminate the findings to stakeholders in a number of ways.

As a way of disseminating findings, after discussing monitoring reports in sectoral committees, executive committees and council meetings, the accounting officer is then required to communicate the recommendations to the implementers. However, an overwhelming majority (17 of 18 [93%]) of LG political office bearers and the majority (28 of 37[75%]) of LG officials interviewed, indicated that where projects are being executed, the contractors have usually either taken too long to take action or have not taken action at all. The findings imply that monitoring recommendations do not effectively inform the implementation process. The findings here do support Kebba and Ntanda (2005:18) who observe that LGs have exhibited poor and inadequate supervision especially in implementing civil works projects such as community roads construction and maintenance.
Preparation and Implementation of Monitoring Plans

The essence of a monitoring plan is that progress of any programme cannot be monitored unless a plan exists against which to monitor (Kumar and Bansal 2010:1; International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies (IFRC) 2011; 32; UNDP 2009:83; IUCN 2004:6-7). In theory, according to the Ministry of Local Government (MoLG 2003:75-76), LGs are required to design and execute effective monitoring plans to guide the monitoring process. Such plans should address a number of key elements such as project areas to be monitored; monitoring indicators; data collection methods; reporting and feedback mechanisms; and monitoring resources. Except for some LGs (4 of 15 [27%]), the majority (11 of 15 [73%]) of LGs did not have specified monitoring plans, but had work plans in which monitoring as a function was reflected. In either case, attempts have been made to address the key elements as indicated below:

Defining Project Monitoring Areas

As a key element to address in monitoring planning, defining project monitoring areas involve identifying specific aspects of the project that need to be monitored during implementation (Hobson et.al 2013:7; Parsons et.al. 2013:13). According to the Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific-Committee on Poverty (ESCAP 2005:3), traditionally, monitoring focused on the inputs and activities of a project. Currently the focus is increasingly changing towards measuring the outputs and impacts of a project to assess the broader development objectives, although inputs and activities are also important. The key monitoring areas of a project include: input, activity, output, outcome and impact as well as compliance with existing regulatory requirements. In monitoring projects, LGs are required to define and focus on such key areas. LGs have made various efforts to monitor a number of key project aspects as indicated below:

Cost/Budget Performance Monitoring

Cost/budget performance monitoring involves continuous tracking of budgeted costs compared to actual costs incurred during project implementation to detect cost deviations. Most of the project budget is consumed during implementation. Therefore, the responsibility of the monitors is to establish how the budgeted resources are being utilised in order to ensure transparency and cost-effectiveness (Waris et.al 2012: 42-43; Mansfield & Macleod 2004:8). In practice, LGs have made some efforts to track project expenditures to ensure that allocated funds are spent on the planned items to guarantee value for money. However, the majority (29 of 37 [78%]) of LGs officials interviewed and an overwhelming majority (17 of 18 [94%]) of LG political office bearers interviewed, revealed that there are many cases where project funds are spent when the work done does not justify all the money spent. It was revealed that in works projects, there are cases where engineers issue completion certificates when the work is not complete—which brings the integrity of these engineers into question. Such findings imply that LGs’ budget performance monitoring efforts have been ineffective.
Input - Output performance Monitoring

Input-output performance monitoring is done through input-output analysis that involves tracking the financial, physical, human, information and time resources that are utilized for a project. The monitoring personnel are expected to track and capture the quantity and quality of resources provided as inputs, the activities undertaken and the goods or services created (outputs) through use of inputs (Parsons, et.al. 2013:10-11; Pasteur and Turrall 2006:2; Mosse and Sontheimer 1996:11). This means collecting data that describe the individuals served, the services provided, and the resources used to deliver those services (World Bank 2008: 21). An analysis of LGs’ work plans revealed that except for some LGs (3 of 15[20%]), in the majority (12 of 15[80%]) of them, the work plans show the planned project inputs and expected outputs. In practice however, the monitoring teams are not guided by the plans in conducting their monitoring activities3. This implies that LGs have not been effective in establishing the results of projects being implemented.

Outcome and Impact Monitoring

The outcome and impact monitoring involve basic tracking of measures related to desired programme outcomes and the long term broader societal changes resulting from policy intervention. Outcome and impact monitoring may be conducted through population-based surveys to track whether desired outcomes have been reached and whether the broader development objectives of the project have been fundamentally and sustainably attained (Parsons et.al. 2013: 16-17; World Bank 2008: 22; European Commission (EC) 2006: 8; Metz 2005). Despite the fact that work plans in the majority (11 of 15[73%]) of LGs, do not indicate expected project outcomes and impact, most central government initiated projects have monitoring guidelines that provide for project inputs, outputs, outcomes and impact. However, according to an overwhelming majority (17 of 18[95%]) of HLG officials interviewed, LGs have not been able to ascertain project outcomes or impact. This is partly attributed to the monitors’ lack of project monitoring knowledge4. Without establishing project impact, the findings imply that LGs have been ineffective in executing their role that should include impact monitoring of programmes.

Establishing Monitoring Indicators

Defining project monitoring areas goes hand in hand with the establishment of monitoring indicators. An indicator can be expressed as a number such as kilometers or percentages. It is a quantitative or qualitative measuring instrument that provides information to monitor performance, measure achievement and determine accountability (Hales 2010: 14; Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) 2009:32; Tanja 2000: 17-18). Indicators are based on the key project variables that relate to project inputs, activities and outputs. For each monitoring area, LGs need to define aspects to be measured and determine the unit criteria of measure such as sizes, numbers, or frequency (United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA) 2004:7; MoLG 2003:48).

References:

1Interview, District Production Officer, Wakiso district, 20th August, 2013; and District Planner, Ntungamo district, 21st October, 2013

2Interview, District NAADS Coordinator, Ntungamo district, 8th October, 2013
Work plans in an overwhelming majority (14 of 15 [93%]) of LGs do not define monitoring indicators for the key aspects of the projects. Where attempts have been made, the indicators are not clear and cannot be applied to assess the progress of a project. The findings here tend to agree with Onyach-Olaa (2003:16-17) who found that most development plans in LGs lacked visions and defined target indicators. Without defining monitoring indicators in their work plans LGs have been unable to measure the results of decentralisation programmes.

Determining Methods of Collecting Data

In monitoring the decentralisation programmes, LGs are expected to determine data collection methods. They have at their disposal, a plethora of methods that can be used for data collection. The most common of these include: observation; interviews; documentary reviews; questionnaires; and participatory rural appraisal approaches (World Bank 2004:6-20; Kusek and Rist 2004:97). It was found that whereas in the majority (11 of 15 [73%]) of LGs, the data collection methods are not specified in their work plans, methods such as observations, interviews, documentary review, and questionnaires have been used. However, the monitors lack the necessary competence to effectively use these methods. All (8 of 8 [100%]) officials at sub county LGs interviewed, indicated that the monitors were not conversant with the data collection methods. The findings suggest that data collection methods have not been effectively utilised in the monitoring process. This has had negative implications on the quality of data collected in terms of accuracy and reliability.

Reporting and Feedback Mechanisms

Monitoring information is normally documented in progress reports. These could be in form of summary bulletins, status report cards or implementation briefs. Progress reports are essential mechanisms for monitoring implementation to inform management and other stakeholders on the progress and problems encountered and lessons learned during the implementation process. Sound progress reports are expected to identify problems, propose solutions and present feasible actionable recommendations. They are especially important to provide early warning signals on any significant current or potential implementation concerns and to get attention, support and response for actions (World Health Organisation (WHO) 2010: 19-20; Mackay 2009; IUCN 2004:10). The research established that LGs have made deliberate efforts to report findings and provide feedback to the project implementers. The recommendations are usually summarised and communicated to the implementers. However, according to all (18 of 18 [100%]) LG political office bearers and all (37 of 37 [100%]) LG officials interviewed, there are no implementation tracking mechanisms to check on what happens to recommendations. This implies that the officials making the recommendations may not know whether their recommendations have been implemented

Allocating Resources

After establishing the tasks to be accomplished in the monitoring plan, LGs are expected to determine the necessary resources. Inadequacy of resources leads to poor quality monitoring. To ensure effective monitoring, it is imperative
to establish the resources that are needed and available (Kumar and Bansal 2010; Metz 2005; UNICEF 1991: 28). The research findings revealed that in all (15 of 15[100%]) LGs, monitoring work plans have some funds allocated to monitoring. In all cases however, the allocated funds are inappropriate compared to the planned monitoring activities. The findings suggest that, due to limited funding, LGs have not been able to effectively carry out their monitoring activities as many of the projects remain unmonitored.

Conclusion

Examining the theory and practice of local governments’ monitoring role in implementing decentralisation was the focus of this article. Empirical evidence has been provided to show that while LGs are theoretically required to design an effective monitoring system and prepare and execute effective monitoring plans to guide the monitoring process, in practice, the numerous efforts that have made have been inefficient and ineffective. The existing monitoring system and monitoring planning are associated with numerous substantial weaknesses that range from limited competence of monitoring data collection organs; lack of an integrated monitoring approach, poor coordination mechanisms among monitoring organs; lack of standard monitoring tools; lack of organs to carry out data analysis; poor information dissemination mechanisms; poor monitoring indicators; lack of defined data collection methods; poor reporting and feedback mechanisms; and unrealistic allocation of resources. The central government and LGs will need to make deliberate practical efforts to address these weaknesses if LGs are to efficiently and effectively monitor the implementation of decentralisation programmes for successful implementation of the decentralisation policy. Unless such efforts are made, the local governments’ monitoring role will remain perhaps theoretically impressive but practically wanting.

References


---

5Interview, NAAIDS Coordinator, Ntungamo district, 8th October 2013


International Federation of Red Cross and Red Crescent Societies (IFRC). 2011. A Project/Programme Monitoring and Evaluation Guide for IFRC


Metz, M. 2005. Monitoring Policy Impacts: The Role of MPI in Policy Formulation and


AJPAM SUBSCRIPTION FORM

1. I/We wish to subscribe to .........................................................................................................................
   Copy/copies of the AFRICAN JOURNAL OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION AND MANAGEMENT with effect
   from the ............... 20.............. Issue.
   My/Our mailing address is:
   Name ..............................................................
   Address ..............................................................

2. I/We attach My/Our Banker’s Order/ Standing Order of US Dollars cheque/ convertible cheque for the
   sum of US$................................................
   (See Subscription Rates)

3. I/ We undertake to notify AAPAM of any changes of address
   Signature..............................................................
   Subscription Forms should be returned to:

The Secretary General,
African Association for Public Administration and Management (AAPAM)
UN Avenue 132 Fuchsia close, Gigiri
P.O. Box 48677, 00100
Nairobi, Kenya
Tel: +254 0202629650/ +254 721366787
Email: aapam@aapam.org/ info@aapam.org
www.aapam.org

Subscription Rates

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Per Issue</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Members of AAPAM</td>
<td>$ 20.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Advertising in AJPAM

The Editorial Board of AJPAM welcomes advertisements in the Journal. Prospective clients are advised to forward their advertisements at least four months before the intended date of publication. The rates are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Per Annum</th>
<th>Per Insertion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Full page</td>
<td>$ 300.00</td>
<td>$ 150.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Half page</td>
<td>$ 150.00</td>
<td>$ 80.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quarter page</td>
<td>$ 80.00</td>
<td>$ 40.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>